

Department of Higher Education and Training

TASK TEAM ON COMMUNITY EDUCATION AND TRAINING CENTRES

Draft Report
Version 4: 12 April 2012

Introduction

TASK TEAM TERMS OF REFERENCE AND METHODOLOGY

Terms of Reference

1. The Departmental Task Team on Community Education and Training Centres (CETC) was appointed in April 2011 and started its work at the beginning of July 2011 after an initial briefing meeting by the Department of Higher Education and Training on 23 June 2011. The purpose of the Task Team was to investigate and recommend an alternative and more effective institutional form for addressing the needs of adults and out-of-school youth. The Task Team was expected to submit its Report by 30 March 2012, this was extended by one month.
2. The terms of reference of the Task Team:
 - 2.1 Conceptualise a workable institutional model for community education and training centres that is distinct and unique. In creating a distinct identity, the following factors are to be considered:
 - (a) Ethos and mission of the institution
 - (b) Diversity of programme offerings
 - (c) Strong articulation with existing institutions
 - (d) Service to community, business and industry
 - (e) Life-long learning opportunities
 - 2.2 Consider the policy and legal implications for a new community education and training system, with particular regard to current legislation.
 - 2.3 Make recommendations on relevant programme offerings by community education and training centres taking into account the distinct identity of the institution.
 - 2.4 Investigate and propose appropriate funding modalities for community education and training centres.
 - 2.5 Investigate and make recommendations on suitable governance mechanisms for the community education and training centres.
 - 2.6 Develop broad implementation steps to institutionalise community education and training centres within a post-school system.
 - 2.7 Review relevant local and international literature on appropriate forms of lifelong learning in making recommendations on community education and training centres.

Members of the Task Team

3. Members of the Task Team appointed by the Director-General and responsible for work leading to and for the final report are:
Ms. Febe Potgieter-Gqubule (Chairperson)

Mr. Michael Cosser
Ms. Tsakani Chaka
Mr. Mabu Raphotle (on behalf of Ms. S. Nxesi)
Prof. John Aitchison
Mr. Ivor Baatjes
Mr. Yershen Pillay

4. Mr. David Diale and Ms. Juliet Sibiya participated and provided support to the Task Team on behalf of the Department of Higher Education and Training.
5. The following members were part of the initial team appointed, but due to other commitments declined to participate:
 - Dr. Julie Reddy
 - Ms. Thansi Masitara
 - Ms. Khosi Xaba
 - Mr. Mugwena Maluleke
 - Ms. Lulama Nare

Methodology

6. In pursuance of its mandate, the Task Team conducted research on local and global experiences of community education and other institutions and programmes aimed at youth and adults, in the form of national and international literature reviews (Annexure A).
7. Given the importance of the policy context and linkages, the Task Team also received submissions and engaged with a range of institutions, individuals and programmes. These submissions took the form of presentations by representatives and individuals at meetings of the team, meeting with such representatives on a one-on-one basis or participating in workshops and meetings where matters relevant to the Task Team brief were discussed. The list of these engagements is in Annexure B.
8. The Task Team furthermore used as foundation documents the *Report of the Ministerial committee on Adult Education of 2008* (DOE, 2008) and the *Report of the Ministerial Committee After school, What? Opening wider and more flexible learning pathways for youth* (DHET, 2009), in addition to other government policies and laws relevant to its brief, including:
 - Adult Education and Training Act 52 of 2000
 - Further Education Training Act 16 of 2006
 - Further Education Training Section 78 Bill of 2011
 - Further Education Amendment Bill, 2012
 - New Institutional Landscape National Plan for FET Colleges in South Africa of 2008
 - Higher Education Act 101 of 1997
 - Skills Development Act 97 of 1998, its amendment Act 37 of 2008,
 - Skills Development Levy Act of 1999,
 - the National Skills Development Strategy (NSDS) I, II and III and
 - National Youth Development Agency Act 54 of 2008
 - Non-Profit Act 71 of 1997

9. Additional documents consulted include a number of relevant research documents, academic papers and articles that have been written over the last ten years.
10. The Task Team also commissioned Community research in three communities in KZN, Limpopo and Gauteng, developing an understanding of education and training needs and experiences of adults and youth in local communities, and how the current system meets (or fails to meet) their needs.
11. Finally, at the stage when the Task Team had conceptualised an institutional model as per its brief, envisaged a Feasibility study to test whether it is a workable model and the implementation implications.

Context of Report

12. The report on Community Education and Training Centres (CETCs) is part of the ongoing transformation of the human resource development landscape and pathways for adults and young people through the education system. This transformation took place in the context of the Constitution that states that everyone has the right to basic education, including adult basic education. It places an obligation on the state to expand access to education and skills development. This transformation cut across the education system; this context will primarily deal with the 'non-school' system of education and training, also referred to as 'post-school education and training.'
13. The first phase of the transformation after 1994 saw the introduction of a new education and training pathway model (Cosser, 2011:70), also known as the National Qualifications Framework. This model consisted of three bands with eight levels: General Education (level 1), Further Education (levels 2-4) and Higher education (levels 5-8); with exist qualifications designed to articulate across the three bands: a General Education and Training Certificate (GETC), a Further Education and Training Certificate and with certificates, diplomas and degrees in the Higher Education and Training bands.
14. This framework was accompanied by changes in the institutional landscape: technical colleges and training centres were incorporated into FET colleges; teacher and nursing colleges closed down and training transferred to education and medical faculties at universities; technikons were merged to form Universities of Technology and some merged with universities to form comprehensive universities. This phase also saw the introduction of a National Skills Development Strategy and institutions in the form of Sector Education Authorities (SETAs) and a National Skills Authority.
15. In adult education, transformation was driven by two imperatives. The first was to eradicate adult literacy and the second to improve the skills of the labour force. The various literacy campaigns, the formalisation of ABET and the move towards universal primary education were aimed at the first imperative; whilst the new curriculum in schools, the new skills regime and the transformation of higher education and FET colleges were aimed at addressing the second.
16. Four major initiatives stood out in this regard. The first was the inclusion of a National

Literacy campaign as one of the Presidential Lead Projects in the White paper on Reconstruction and Development in 1994. This however, was one of only two programmes that did not receive an allocation from the RDP fund and was very small scale. It was eventually received R90m from DoE funds with a national target of 90,000 learners. The second is the formalisation of Adult Basic Education within the NQF and the regulation and finance of Public Adult Learning Centres (PALCs) under the Adult Basic Education and Training Act (No. 52 of 2000). The third was the South Africa National Literacy Initiative (SANLI) in 2002 with the ambitious goal of breaking the back of illiteracy. This programme was slightly more effective than the first literacy campaign, reaching over two years over 400 000 adult learners. The fourth initiative is the national *Kha Ri Gude* literacy campaign launched in 2008, which up to 2011 has reached around 2.5 million learners.

17. In addition, non-governmental organisations and companies, later within the context of the NQF the National Skills Development Strategy, also continued to provide adult education and training programmes. There has been a significant decline in NGO work in adult literacy since 2000. Many have closed whilst others have opted to become private providers under the NSDS and SETA regime.
18. The establishment of a separate Ministry of Higher Education and Training, with the Ministry of Basic Education focusing primarily on schooling, in 2009 heralds the beginning of a second phase of the human resources development transformation. This process consolidated within DHET the majority of the components of what is now known as the Post school system of education and training. In order to improve the functioning of this system a *Green Paper for Post-schooling Education and Training* was published for discussions in January 2012.
19. Parallel and linked to the Green Paper process are the ongoing review and improvement programmes for the SETAs and FET colleges, the review of the National Qualifications Framework, the review of universities and the work of the CETC Task Team to define a new institutional form or forms to better address and expand education and training opportunities for adults and young people. It is understood that the recommendations of the CETC Task Team will eventually be incorporated into the White Paper for Post-Schooling Education and Training, based on decisions of the Ministry with regards to such recommendations.

Report outline

20. The Final report will consist of the following sections:

- | | |
|------------|---|
| Section 1: | South Africa's developmental agenda and education opportunities for adults and young people |
| Section 2: | Literature reviews – national and international and Summary of submissions |
| Section 3: | Community research |
| Section 4: | THE INSTITUTIONAL PROPOSAL <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assumptions • Vision for Adult and Youth education • Disaggregated target groups • Proposed Institutional model and Options |

- Governance issues
- Institutional development and capacity building
- Linkages and articulation
- Funding

Section 5: Implementation steps

Section 6: Conclusion

Section 1

SOUTH AFRICA'S DEVELOPMENTAL AGENDA AND EDUCATION OPPORTUNITIES FOR ADULTS AND YOUNG PEOPLE

There were no schools at all in some of our villages and small places where we come from. In other places there were only primary schools up to Std 1. After passing Std. 1, we would have to go and attend schools far away. Then transport becomes a problem and money too.

(A literacy learner quoted in "Never too old to learn", Learn and Teach/ELP/LACOM, 1991)

The majority of young people will leave school at the end of the compulsory period. Precisely where these young people will go is a serious economic and political question which has major implications for the future ET system...Therefore, the majority of young people, along with the millions of others who were denied the opportunity to complete schooling, have needs beyond those traditionally catered for by the general education system. (Bird and Elliot, 1993:6)

1. South Africa has registered important achievements since the advent of democracy in 1994. Not least amongst these were the rapid integration of the racially segregated education and training institutions, ensuring near-universal access to primary and increasingly secondary education, the introduction and expansion of early childhood development, expanding access to higher and further education and putting in place a skills regime that seeks to provide access to ongoing training to those in the work force.
2. Despite these achievements, the Green Paper for Post-School Education and Training noted that "the system continues to produce and reproduce gender, class, racial and other inequalities with regard to access to educational opportunities and success." Two groups that are particularly disadvantaged are adults and young people who are not in formal workplaces or educational institutions, who have little opportunities for access to first or second chance learning, let alone lifelong learning. This poses a problem for the following reasons. Firstly, these groups include close to 12 million adults with less than Grade 9 education; this figure include the nearly three million young people not in education or in employment (NEETs) between the ages of 18-24 years, who are also in need of education and training opportunities. Only 7% of workers without 10 years of schooling are employed in the formal economy. Adults and youth without 10 years of schooling are vulnerable and at risk of losing their jobs in an economy that demands ever higher levels of knowledge and skills (Baatjes, 2008).
3. The transformation in education took place in a context where there were many demands on the fiscus, including a considerable period of fiscal belt-tightening during which expenditure on education and training (especially schools and universities) remained relatively static. Adult education in particular has suffered from this situation, which account for the low participation rate in ABET (around 0.1%). For example, some provinces had to suspend their ABET classes during 1998-2000. Since the mid-1990s the budget for ABET was 0.83% of the national education budget and has now, over a period of 15 years increased to just under 2% of the national budget for education.
4. The debates about adult and youth training have been dominated by two approaches. On the one hand is the 'education as a right' approach that regards education as a fundamental human right and essential for the exercise of other human rights. This approach has informed South Africa's long history of adult and people's education approaches. The

second approach is the 'human capital' approach, and approach that suggests that through investment in education and health, labour surplus countries (and especially those with a youth bulge) can more effectively utilise their human resources as part of national development. In our education and training policy documents both approaches are evident.

5. Neo-classical scholars during the early 1970s questioned the human capital approaches and argued “education was powerless to alter the fundamental class location and labour market trajectories of working class learners” (Kraak, 2001:111). A further development during the 1980s, based on the Brettonwood institutions' “rate of return on investment in education” approach, was a move away from investment in secondary and post-school education (include adult education), towards focussing on primary education. This, according to Cloete et al (2011:5) led to the “de-establishment of research centres, medical schools, agricultural centres, tele-communication and technological development centres, business training centres, vocational schools and other areas of higher education sectors, which are critical to the development of African societies and their economies.”
6. In a significant shift during the 1990s – especially in the context of writings about the Asian and other developmental states, but also about the knowledge economy – it is now argued that education and human resource development play a critical role in economic development, poverty reduction and reducing inequality. This, however, remains contested because there are, similarly to the triad of unemployment, poverty and inequality, no shared conceptualisation of the relationship between education, poverty reduction and inequality. Given the complexity, contesting views and new research suggest that world-wide economic systems that embraced and apply narrow notions of human capital theory has failed to deliver education, employment and rewards (Brown, Lauder & Ahton, 2010; Marsh, XX; Margison-Hyslop & Sears, 2010).
7. South African debates on education and training are informed by both the education as a right and the human capital approaches. Thus the Reconstruction and Development Programme (ANC, 1994:59) saw developing human resources as a central pillar, “providing opportunities for people to develop themselves in order to improve the quality of their lives and the standard of living of their communities...alongside ensuring that basic needs are met, the society is democratised and that the economy grows.”
8. More recently, the National Planning Commission (2011:261) echoed this importance of education and training in its draft Vision for the next two decades, recognising that:
Education and training and innovation are critical to South Africa's long-term development. They are core elements in eliminating poverty and reducing inequality, and the foundations of an equal society. Education empowers people to define their identity, take control of their lives, raise healthy families, take part confidently in developing a just society, and play an effective role in the (development) and governance of their communities.

Problem statement: the learning needs of adults

9. The Report of the Ministerial Committee on Adult Education (DOE, 2008:17) noted that very little has been written about the possible identities of South Africa's adult learners. It thus posed the questions: “are the majority of them women, where do they live, what skills and interests do they have, are they mostly young people who have dropped out of school

and are looking for a 'second chance' to complete school, are they mid-career people who want their prior learning and experience to be recognised that will give them access to education, do they want or need a qualification or are they interested in learning for other reasons?

10. Although the report does not answer all of these questions, it provided a working definition of adult learners, to include the age range of 15 to 55 years as most likely interested in still completing their education or in learning more generally. These adults in 2001 amounted to nearly 7 million with less than a Grade 7 and a further 11 million who completed a level lower than Grade 9.
11. The CETC Task Team has some concerns about the rigid application of this age range. On the one hand at the lower age cohorts, there are thousands of youngsters below the age of 15 years who drop out of school every year. Some of them are unlikely to go back to school, or due to their age may not be allowed back into school. What provision is being made to provide them with second chance education opportunities, or should they wait till they reach the age of 15 to be considered? A second problem is the cut-off age of 55 years. Although South Africa has a youth bulge and a very low life expectancy rate, older people continue to play an important role in society, not least because they have experience that could and should be imparted to other generations and because given the burden of disease, grandparents increasingly are taking on responsibilities for raising orphans and children. This latter group therefore is also in need of learning opportunities to empower them to continue to play these roles thrust upon them by circumstances. The Task Team will therefore use the working definition of 15-55 years as the main, but not exclusive target group for the new institutional model, but also make some recommendations for groups that fall outside of this age range.
12. The National Education Policy Investigation (quoted in DOE, 2008:9) during the early 1990s identified a number of goals with regards adult educational needs, urging the state to:
 - Provide adult education of high quality, which would enable adults to obtain a broad general education.
 - Provide vocational training of high quality, which addresses the needs of industry, as well as other sectors of the economy.
 - Support non-governmental organisations and community based organisations that offer flexible needs-based programmes as well as skills programmes; and
 - Create a supportive environment for recognising other forms of learning including short skills courses, which serve a variety of learner needs in their immediate environment.
13. The Report on Adult Education (DOE, 2008) also identified the range of learning needs of this target group, including broad general education (literacy and up to ABET 4), vocational and skills development and flexible needs programmes. The CETC Task Team agrees with this needs assessment, with the additions of personal and community development programmes aimed at promoting social development and cohesion, SMMEs, sustainable livelihoods and cooperatives. These programmes serve different purposes and should be viewed within a bigger democratic learning framework which we argue should be adopted. This framework equally applies to human capital career education (instrumentalist tradition) and citizenship education (emancipatory tradition) as both could serve the development of a substantive democracy.

14. In the context of the above, the UNESCO definition of 'adult education' is relevant, denoting

“...the entire body of organised educational processes, whatever the content, level and method, whether formal or otherwise, whether they prolong or replace initial education in schools, colleges and universities as well as in apprenticeship, whereby persons regarded as adult by the society to which they belong develop their abilities enrich their knowledge, improve their technical and professional qualifications or turn them in a new direction and bring about changes in their attitudes or behaviour in twofold perspective of full personal development and participation in balanced and independent social, economic and cultural development ...adult education, however, must not be considered an entity in itself, it is a sub-division, and an integral part of, a global scheme for life-long education and learning.” (From the *Recommendation on the Development of Adult Education*, UNESCO, 1976 p.2, quoted in Aitchison, 2012:5)

15. Adult education in the above sense therefore is about life-long learning opportunities and an expanded view of learning that include both formal and non-formal programmes, and is embedded in the political, social, cultural and economic processes in the country. Adult education in the South African qualifications framework and pathways therefore encompasses post-school adult learning in its broadest sense, including articulation with and access to university education.

Problem statement: the learning needs of youth not in employment, education or training

“How prepared is South Africa to make the most of (its) demographic dividend? We know that the current youth cohort is the best educated ever, they are the healthiest sector of the population, and our Constitution grants them agency and platforms to influence political processes and civic life. Yet two to three decades of research, as well as prior investments in youth development, leave us with many unanswered and some emerging questions.” HSRC Youth Policy Initiative Roundtables, 2007

16. Alongside the work on adult learners is a growing focus on the so-called NEETs, young people ages 18-24 years who are not in education, employment or training. The Ministerial report *After school, what?* (DHET, 2009:1) raises the problem thus: “At the beginning of the twenty first century, it is becoming very clear that South African education is lagging behind developed and developing countries in the provision and availability of a range of educational opportunities to those who exist the school system. The problem of youth who do not complete their school education; who are not in training and not in employment; and who have no access to some form of post-secondary education has recently become more and more significant and many stakeholders are grappling with the question of youth education and employability.”
17. South Africa's labour market is particularly harsh for first time entrants in general and school leavers in particular. At least half of all young people (18-24 years) are unlikely to find work before the age of 24 years, while their employment chances improve as they get older. Whilst their labour market entry is thus delayed, they also do not have much opportunities for improving their education and skills after leaving school, nor are there many second chance opportunities to complete their schooling if they dropped out of school.
18. Thus according to Sheppard (2009) in 2007 there were over a million young people in this age group with primary school education and less than Grade 10 attainment, a further one million with Grade 10 but less than Matric, and nearly 700 000 young people with Matric –

nearly three million not in employment, nor in education or training. The education system and labour market currently force young people prematurely into the harsh realities of a life of inactivity. Every year a further 500 000 young men and women joined the group of NEETs. This clearly is both a social and an economic waste. South Africa's youth bulge is also likely to last for more than one generation, which will cause ongoing problems unless we develop the educational and labour market capacity to make young people productive and thus reap a demographic dividend (Altman and Potgieter, 2009).

19. Young people globally and in South Africa generally have an unemployment rate three times higher than the rate for adults. When economic growth is low, employment growth do not create enough jobs to absorb the existing army of unemployed, let alone new entrants into the labour market. In addition, young people lack relevant education, experience and the skills that underpin employability as well as the mobility, resources and networks to look for jobs. Employers look for skills and experience and view inexperienced and unskilled jobseekers as a risky investment. They regard entry level wages as too high relative to the risk of employing inexperienced young workers (Altman and Marock, 2008 and National Treasury, 2011).
20. Approaches to deal with the challenges of the youth labour market are usually multi-faceted and include:
 - Economic policy aimed at raising aggregate demand for labour and wage employment;
 - Promoting self-employment and entrepreneurship;
 - Education, training and skills development;
 - Education and training/school to work linkages and labour market information
 - Special employment programmes (e.g. public works or youth service programmes);
 - Promoting youth employment (learnerships, youth service to address experience gap, youth wage subsidies, etc).
21. South Africa implements various aspects of the above, including youth quotas in the Expanded Public Works Programme; the National Youth Service Programme; self-employment and entrepreneurial programmes through NYDA and the DTI small business agencies; and more recently the proposals from National Treasury (2011) for a youth wage subsidy.
22. Education and training interventions to address the challenges that young people face fall within the following two categories (O'Higgins, 2001:62):
 - Improving the quality of the school system, and measures to reduce substantially the numbers of young people who drop out of the school system; and
 - Equipping young people with skills relevant to the labour market and with greater ability to adapt to technological and economic change.
23. The *After school, what?* report therefor argues that in order to “provide effective interventions to deal with the looming youth crisis, education must take the lead and re-arrange its systems so that young people may be contained in the education system for longer, thus providing extended opportunity for developing additional skills and acquiring further knowledge.” The report therefore advanced the following propositions (DHET, 2009:3):
 - To retain young people in various forms of learning programmes until they are closer to

the age of 24 years, by providing an achievable secondary education system, followed by comprehensive post-secondary education and/or skills development.

- Providing second chance opportunities and programmes.
- Providing a wide range of flexible (and accessible) learning pathways to ensure that a wide range of young people can find home institutions, programmes of interests and delivery mechanisms that would suit them.

24. The education and training interventions on their own will however not address the totality of the challenges facing young men and women, it should be closely linked to other interventions including stronger efforts to create in jobs in the formal economy and to improve informal jobs, and the performance of and support for SMMES and cooperatives.

Current provision for learning needs of adults and youth

25. South Africa has a long history of finding innovative ways to provide adults and young people with opportunities to learn, in the face of deliberate exclusion. These range from the first workers night schools started in 1919 to the myriad of popular education programmes that was a key feature of the liberation struggle and sectoral organisations. In addition, with the growth of the trade union movements and international sanctions, large companies in the 1980s, especially in the mining sector, were obliged to provide adult education under pressure from foreign investors (Bird, Vally, Chisholm, 1994, Lolwana, 2011). The community and popular education initiatives provided adults and young people with skills (literacy, numeracy and communication) as well as developed their capabilities as individuals, sectors and communities to contribute towards social change and social justice, whilst the work-based training focused on literacy.

26. Building on these experiences, the post-1994 education and training framework embraced the concept of lifelong learning, recognising that learning takes place throughout a person's life and takes place in many forms. The main provision was initially directed to formalising the system of Adult Basic Education (ABET) in Public Adult Learning Centres, industry sites and communities as part of the National Qualification Framework. Secondly, efforts were made to eradicate illiteracy through campaigns, and since 2008 the Kha Ri Gude campaign in particular. In addition, much adult education and youth learning also take place through a variety of non-formal community and popular education initiatives and projects run by community and faith based organisations, trade unions, social movements and government departments.

27. Thus education and training opportunities for adults and youth are currently provide by the state, as well as business, industry and civil society. The South African literature review (Raphotle, 2012) identifies four distinct institutional forms that supply education and training in some form or others, outside of the school system. “Institutional form” is defined as physical centre/school/university/college infrastructure and facilities that accommodate young people and adults for the purpose of tuition. These four types are:

- Private and Public Adult Learning Centres,
- Public and private FET colleges,
- Public and private higher education institutions; and
- Not-for-profit organisations and Multi-Purpose Community Centres.

28. Each of the above institution have distinct legal and organisational forms, funding, programme offerings and institutional arrangements, as can be seen in Table 1 below. The table also summarises the numbers and governance arrangements of these institutional forms:

TABLE 1: SUMMARY OF INSTITUTIONAL FORMS PROVIDING LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES FOR ADULTS AND YOUTH (Raphotle, 2012)				
	Adult Learning Centres	FET colleges	Higher Education Institutions	NPOs and CLCs
Distinct	Formal institutions, regulated and funded through the AET Act, 2000 Public Adult Learning Centres (PALCs) operate mainly within or linked to schools, and some have satellite sites. AET Act, provides for private PALCs to register with department. Two types of private ALCs: company based private sector centres mainly for employees and not-for-profit community based adult learning centres.	Integration of racially fragmented technical education through FET Act of 1998, merger of 150 institutions into 50 public FET colleges. FET Act provides for registration of Private FET colleges accredited by Umalusi, whilst the Skills Development Act provides for accreditation of skills development providers (private or public).	Size and shape report merger of SA universities into 23 public HEIs: 11 academic, 6 comprehensive and 6 universities of technology, governed by the Higher Education Act of 1997. HE Act amended in 2000 and 2001 provision for private universities and must be registered. Not for profit HE institutions ran by religious, philanthropic groups and employers	Trust, company or association established for public purpose and not for profit. Usually registered as Sect 21 company., provide education as their main purpose or as an addition to their main purpose. Many faith-based organisations FBOs in this category. Multi-purpose community centres (MPCCs)
Access and numbers	PALC numbers fluctuate between 2000-2500 centres. As of January 2012, 1713 private and community based AE providers registered with DHET. PALC learner numbers: fluctuating between 250 000 and 360 000 between 2004 and 2010. No figures available for learners in private ALCs., Generally, ALCs – both public and private - in terms of learners achieving the GETC are described as having a 'pitifully inadequate output.' Since PALCs use schools, fair geographic spread.	50 Public FET colleges with 232 campuses or learning sites (2011). 272-455 Private FET colleges registered with DHET, and about 1000 FET providers registered. Just over 300 000 learners registered with capacity for up to 400 000 at public FET colleges. 37 520 learners in FET private colleges. Final check on geographic spread of Public FET colleges – recent HSRC audit	23 Public universities: 6 large (>30,000 students), 8 medium (20 000-29 999 students) and 9 small (<20 000 students). In 2009 a total of 837 779 students enrolled, including 316 349 distance education students 108 private universities registered in 2010, but some instability, actual figure closer to 87. Student enrollment figures at Private HEIs range from 20 to 15000 students, top 9 private HEIs enrolled around 50 000 students in 2009.	More than 200 MPCCs, including, 149 Thusong centres 59% of FBOs reach < 200 people per month, 45% < 100 per month.
Program offerings	PALCs: two main qualifications – GET Certificate also known as ABET level 4 or NQF level 1 and the Senior Certificate for youth and adults who did not pass grade 12 through the school system. Offered mainly part-time, at night because of use of schools, some during the day but still part-time. Grade 12 or SC at NQF 4, serves as second chance for youth who failed 3-4 subjects in Grade 12	Public and Private FETs: National Certificate Vocational (3 year full-time); NATED courses (N1-N6 and National N courses, mainly full-time. Also NQF qualifications, short courses – part-time or learnerships.	Full qualifications certificates, diplomas, degrees in the NQF 5-10 bands: national certificates and diplomas for intermediate skills, undergraduate, honours, masters, doctoral and post-doctoral degrees for high level skills.	Non-formal education programmes including around home based care, literacy classes, life skills training, HIV education, community development MPCC provide one-stop shop for various community needs, government information and services, small business support and information. Educational, but focus on information and service
Quality assurance	Umalusi for the GETC/ABET 4, ABET levels 1-3 are internal assessments.	NCV and N1-3 quality assured by Umalusi, none for N4-6 and N diploma. NQF	Both public and private quality assurance for all qualifications by the Higher	Mainly non-formal and non-accredited programmes

TABLE 1: SUMMARY OF INSTITUTIONAL FORMS PROVIDING LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES FOR ADULTS AND YOUTH (Raphotle, 2012)

	Adult Learning Centres	FET colleges	Higher Education Institutions	NPOs and CLCs
		and short courses quality assured by SETAs	Education Quality Committee.	
External linkages	Being schools-based encourage PALCS links with communities, although poorly marketing in communities where they operate	The recent HSRC report (2012) of FET colleges show poor linkages with industry and business, and especially with local communities	Mixed bag of community links, faculty links with professional associations. Most have some graduate placement programmes, but mixed.	Strong NPO and FBO links with communities and sectors, links with business and industry mainly as donors. MPCCs also community based, link with business as most non-Thusong sponsored by local industry.
Articulation	Poor articulation with FET colleges for these AET graduates. Also poor linkages with Kha Ri Gude graduates, very few proceed to PALCs.	Poor articulation with HEI, Neither the NCV nor N graduates can access universities with their qualifications, even Universities of Technology.	Poor articulation between HEIs and other post-school education, but also poor horizontal articulation amongst universities.	
Governance and HR	Governance of PALC regulated by AET Act, with Governing body drawn mainly from internal stakeholders who are volunteers. National Advisory Board for ABET (NABAET) in AET Act to advocate for resourcing and funding for sector, never established. AET Act provides for PALC management centre, with educators and support staff. In 2010 a total of 14 443 staff were employed and in 2011 .	College staff employment devolved by FET Act, 2006 to colleges, resulted in poor conditions of employment.	45 012 full-time public HEI staff, 15 939 professional, 23 555 administrative and 5521 service. No figures for staff at private HE's, but large contingent of part-time staff.	Boards or other forms of internally regulated governing structures. NPOs mainly black women, 73% of full-time staff. FBOs small with less than 20 employees
Funding	PALC main source of funding provincial departments of education, often obscured under other funding categories. In 2006 provinces spent on average less than 1% of education budgets on AET, and great disparities across provinces.	Public FETs - Shift in funding to DHET, 3 year conditional grant, Funding increased from R800 million in 2000 to around R4 billion in 2011 Initially student fees for NC(V), but now funded by state, starting with NC(4) and extended to NC(V) 2 and 4. Student fees for NATED programmes Private FETs funded through student fees, employer and public entities contracts.	Public funding based on research output, growth in system at 4.8% per annum, but budget only for 2.8% growth. Spending on HE declined from 0.9% of GDP late 1980s to 0.6% in 2009. Per-student expenditure by government declined from R27 900 in 1987 to R14 700 in 2009 in real terms (using 2005 Rand value). Part of HE funding therefore also student fees. Private HEIs entirely funded from fees.	Some public funding for NGOs, MPCCs and CBOs, other sources donors, and private business through CSR. Foreign donor funding for the sector declined by as much as 40-50% over the last two decades. MPCCs private and foreign donor funded, Thusong centers public funding.

29. In addition to these institutional forms, Raphotle also identifies Supplementary institutional forms, so called because although they do not provide direct tuition, they supply support and supplement the above institutions by providing funding or additional programmes. Two such are discussed – the Sector Education and Training Authorities (SETAs) and the National Youth Development Agency (NYDA) – see Table 2 below.

TABLE 2: SUMMARY OF SUPPLEMENTARY INSTITUTIONS PROVIDING FOR ADULTS AND YOUTH (Raphotle, 2012)		
	SETAs	NYDA
Distinct	Set up in accordance with the Skills Development Act of 1998 in a national economic sector, each developing and implementing a Sector Skills Plan, within an overall 5 year National Skills Development Strategy. Established formally in 2000, reduced from 25 to 21.	NYDA created with the NYDA Act of 2008 out of a merger of the National Youth Commission and the Umsobomvu Youth Fund. Main purpose to advance integration of youth development in public and private sectors.
Access and numbers	Should be accessible to all employers and employees in a given sector, However just over 100, 000 learners enrolled through SETAs in 2011. Figures for work-place training by companies. Provision of SETA training programmes mainly through private providers	NYDA skills development programmes reached about 30 000 youth per year, and a further 400 000 youth make use of its youth information and career guidance services. The latter services are provide through walk in Youth Advisory Centres (YACs) or online. NYDA offices in 9 provinces, and YACs in nearly every municipality: 14 fully fledged YACs and 100 YAC points, usually in partnership with other organisations, at public FET colleges or with local government
Programme offerings	Learnerships and skills programmes based on registered unit standards on NQF levels 1-6., internships and apprenticeships. Private FETs also provide occupational qualifications on behalf of the SETAs	NYDA skills development programmes: include entrepreneurship and business management training, job preparedness, technical skills training, experiential programmes, Youthbuild, career guidance, Second chance Matric Rewrite. Youth economic participation programmes: job creation, entrepreneurship support programmes such as business vouchers, mentorship, registration of new youth owned businesses, youth cooperatives support and financial support for youth entrepreneurship. All these are implemented with businesses, industry and employers. Also implements the National Youth Service Programme, that combines work experience in community and public projects with structured learning, including vocational and life skills.
Quality assurance	ETQAs and Umalusi	
External linkages	Insufficient links with communities , concerted efforts through NSDS II and III to address this and especially continue to strengthen links with business and industry. ,	Main focus on economic participation of youth, strong industry and business partnership links, and also with departments and provincial and local spheres of government.
Articulation	Poor articulation with other FET and HE institutions, Recognition by employers?	
Funding	SETA funding through Skills levy, funding Learnerships, skills programmes, internships and apprenticeships, also bursaries to individual students in scarce skills areas	NYDA receives grant funding through the Presidency budget, and in turn funds its programmes. Also co-funding with other departments and business.

30. All of the above institutional forms and the funding there-of combined provide for around 1.8-2 million learning opportunities, and is therefore inadequate to provide for the demand that is potentially as high as five-ten times this figure. In addition, the current system also suffers from the following challenges:

- Very poor articulation across the entire post school system, despite the existence of the National Qualification Framework that was put in place to facilitate articulation.
- Minimal support for and recognition of the role that non-formal and popular education can play in the development and empowerment of youth and adults, in general public

- education campaigns or in building social cohesion and social capital.
- Too little differentiation, too few flexible pathways, rigidity in offerings (part or full-time) for young people and adults and insufficient focus on a quality GETC qualification and post-NQF4 qualifications and programme offerings.
- Current ABET approach and curriculum in the PALCs with the focus on general education often means they fail to attract large numbers of adults and youth interested not only in completing a school qualification but also in gaining labour market and sustainable livelihoods skills. Adults (and youth) also experience a number of interrelated barriers to participation including psychological, situational and structural. Most of these are directly related to the material condition of adults
- Programmes for youth and adults interested in learning for self-improvement, or cultural and community development are mainly provided by faith based organisations, youth organisations or community organisations.
- The FET college sector has a poor 'second chance' track record of getting large numbers of youth through the Grade 11 and 12 syllabus. It also has a poor track record of working with young people who have a poor schooling profile and whose greatest priority is to find employment. They would have benefitted more from some form of work-based training, in addition to completing their NSC.
- Geographic spread of Post-school institutions (separate section with mapping?)

A new vision for Post-school education - the Green Paper, 2012 and the National Development Plan: Vision 2030

31. The formation of the Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) in 2009 placed nearly all elements of the non-schooling system under one roof. Although the transformation initiatives preceding this aimed to create a single integrated system of education and training, the *Green Paper for Post-School Education and Training* initiated by the DHET takes stock of the outcomes of this process, eighteen years later and aims to “provide a vision for a single, coherent, differentiated and highly articulated post-school education and training system... that (should) overcome the structural challenges of society, by expanding access to education and training opportunities and increasing equity, as well as achieving high levels of excellence and innovation.”
32. The education and training system, which is at the core of a human resource development policy, in the current policy context is divided in **Basic Education** (which refers to schooling and inclusive of early childhood development) and **Post-school education and training** referring to “all education and training for people who have left school as well as those who have never been to school.” Post-school education furthermore includes adult education and continuing education, further education and training, skills development and higher education, in both formal and non-formal settings.
33. The Green Paper identified the key challenges facing by the Post-school system as “inadequate quality, quantity and diversity of provision.” It further to acknowledges that “there are very few educational opportunities available to adults and young people who have left school in the early stages, or failed to obtain a National Senior Certificate, or who do not meet the admission and selection criteria for higher education. There is little accessible provision to assist people to catch up on the learning they have missed out on. There are few alternatives for those who seek a vocational or occupational qualification. There are inadequate financial resources to allow

most school-leavers, including Matriculants to successfully enter post-school provision. Currently, approximately three times as many students enter universities each year as do colleges. This 'inverted pyramid' is a major problem and results in a workforce with serious shortages of artisanal and other mid-level skills. (DHET, 2012:9)

34. The Green Paper therefore proposes a new vision for Post-school education and training system that should:
 - Be a single, coherent, differentiated and highly articulated system.
 - Be equitable, accessible and affordable, including free education and training for the poor.
35. To achieve this, the Post-school system over the next twenty years should dramatically expand access, providing a range of accessible alternatives and a more diversified mix of programmes to young people and adults. To achieve this, the Green Paper (and the National Planning Commission's proposed Vision 2030 both target increasing university headcount enrollment, but more significantly to have tripled provision in the Colleges sector by 2030, including through Community education and training centres. These supply-side measures need to be linked with the demand for capabilities and skills in the labour market, as well as the social, public and development sector. This, according to the NPC (2011:277) should increase the participation of 20-24 year olds in education and training from the 3% of age group to about 25% by 2030.

Table : Targets for 2030 enrollment in the Post-school sector

Institutions (public and private)	DHET headcount enrollment target by 2030	NPC headcount enrollment target by 2030
Universities	1,500 000	1,600 000
FET colleges and CETCs	4,000 000	2,250 000 of which FETCs: 1,250 000 and CETCs: 1,000 000

Sources: DHET, 2012:5 and NPC 2011:277

36. The DHET must therefore build, support and resource this expanded system by prioritising and building the public sector colleges and community education sectors, whilst creating an enabling environment for private provision.
37. The NPC plan (2011:288-293) further suggests that critical actions to achieve an expanded, strengthened and diversified institutional Post-school landscape should include:
 - Laying a solid foundation for a long and healthy life and higher education and science achievements through investments in early childhood development and strengthening the school system.
 - The development of a set of strong national qualifications and a variety of non-formal programmes.
 - Strengthening and expanding FET colleges by addressing their infrastructure and other institutional challenges, chief among which is the training of colleges lecturers.
 - Gradually expanding adult education offered in colleges; and
 - Build new public colleges.
 - Improve systems for skills planning and shaping the production of skills

- Build a strong and streamlined quality assurance and qualification system
- Expand the production of highly skilled professionals and enhance innovation capacity
- Enhance and instill entrepreneurial capabilities throughout the system
- Strengthening universities by building and funding an enabling and differentiated system; addressing the decline of the humanities and assist institutions in chronic distress.

38. The National Planning Commission thus concludes (2011:294):

Helping people to develop their skills and enhance their capabilities is an essential part of a sustainable strategy for tackling poverty. Education, training and innovation are central to this. Highly educated and trained individuals have much better chances in the labour market and a nation with highly educated citizens, particularly in science, engineering and technology and the humanities is more competitive and will be able to participate in the knowledge driven economy of the future. The national economy benefits when there is a critical mass of highly skilled people as the current skills shortages have raised the cost of many vital skills.

Implications of the Green Paper for the CETCs establishment¹

39. **Expansion of the Post school system:** massive expansion of the FET colleges system (to 4 million headcount enrollment) remains the key policy goal of the current administration articulated through the DHET target. The NPC sets a much lesser target of 2,25 million enrollments for the same period (2030) and divide this into 1,25 million enrolled in FET colleges and a further 1 million in CETCs. Given the current low base with fewer than 350 000 in FETCs and about the same number or less in PALCs, and a largely static enrollment profile over the past decade, the question should be asked whether this is a realistic goal. Two specific challenges in this regard.

40. Firstly, whether funding will be committed to reach these ambitious goal. There are some positive signs from the funding of FET colleges, that increased from R800 million per annum in 2000 to around R4 billion by 2011. At the same time, funding of universities (growing at about 2.8% p.a.) have not kept up with growth in the sector (growing at 4.8% p.a.) and per-student public expenditure have taken a dramatic dive over the last two decades. Similarly the funding track record of adult education has also been less than sterling, starting with the first unfunded literacy programme in spite of being one of the Presidential Lead Projects announced in 1994, to the perpetual underfunding of PALCs since their formation in 2000.

41. A second challenge is whether there is an appetite for creating new FET and Higher education institutions. Since 1994, with the merger of universities and technikons and the closure of nursing and teaching colleges, no new public Post-school institutions have been established, besides the PALCs. The DHET and the NPC identified the need for the creation of both new public colleges and CETCs, which is a positive sign.

42. **A bolder vision for the Post-school landscape:** The approach towards institutional expansion and diversification in the Green paper focuses on “strengthening existing

¹ Section based on input by Michael Cosser, 5 March 2012 and Task Team deliberations on the Green Paper at various meetings.

institutions, ensuring that the regulatory frameworks support both emerging and established institutions and diversifying and increasing institutions where necessary. Ensuring substantial improvements in throughput will already expand the pool of qualified people leaving the post-school system. The next step will be phased expansion and diversification.” (DHET, 2012:19).

43. At first glance this seems sensible. But what if the conceptualization of what FET colleges are and what programmes they should be providing is misguided? Do we press on, hoping throughput will improve, in the face of:
 - The amorphousness of FET college provision and consequent lack of identity of the sector.
 - The inappropriateness of the levels at which the NCV is offered; and
 - The dilution of technical education and consequent absence of a clear pathway to Universities of Technology?
44. These issues are not sufficiently addressed in the Green paper, thus stopping short of a clear vision of the size and shape of the Post-school sector. One aspect of diversification raised are the 'other non-FET colleges' including re-opening some teachers training colleges and either improving coordination between DHET and departmentally based colleges such as nursing and agricultural colleges or shifting them all under the DHET Post school system of colleges.
45. ***The responses to the NEET problem:*** provision is made in the Green Paper and the National Development Plan for the possible establishment of CETCs to cater for the diverse learning needs of adults and out-of-school youth. While adult learning opportunities are currently provided through the PALCs, there is no institutional model catering for the diverse learning needs of young people not in employment, education or training and not severely disabled. The proposal for a new institutional form that must also provide for youth, and to some extent the NT proposals for a youth wage subsidy, on the face of it, smacks of a bureaucratic response to a massive and multi-faceted social problem that goes way beyond the lack of employment, education and training captured in the NEET acronym.
46. ***Addressing private and non-formal provision:*** The Green Paper focusses on public provision (the NDP to a lesser extent so), but we also need to explore the possible contribution of the private and non-for-profit sectors to expanding student enrollments in the post-school sector. The diversity of institutional configurations in these sectors made it difficult to regulate, oversee and monitor, especially quality assurance. These options of public-private-NPO partnerships and private provisions must however be explored if the country is to meet the huge demands. Apart from the fees issue, private provision, especially delinked from institutions present a particular problem that requires some further reflection.
47. ***Sequencing of expansion:*** We need to ask whether the plans for expansion fit with the proposals for diversification. The argument made here is that consolidation, expansion and diversification cannot be undertaken sequentially as proposed in the Green Paper: the size and nature of those NEET alone highlights the need for concerted action on all three fronts – action that cannot happen outside of a vision of the entire post-school sector and a plan that spells out the desired size and shape of the post-school landscape.

48. ***Implications for establishment of CETCs:*** the above issues confirms the brief of this Task Team, including providing questions to such issues as:
- What proportion the target should CEATs notionally be catering for;
 - What programme offerings and at what levels should CEAT provision be pitched;
 - For which target groups;
 - Should CETCs absorb PALCs, build on successful PALCs or development of an entirely new institutional form which draws on PALCs in a less formal way;
 - What will make CEATs distinctive?
 - In what ways and to what extent will CETC provision be expected to meet the unemployment needs of the country?

Section 2

Reviews of the literature on appropriate institutional forms for lifelong learning

1. The Task Team as per its brief commissioned two literature reviews, South African and international, to see what was said about institutional forms of provision for youth and adult education that might be appropriate for, or have a bearing on, the establishment of Community Education and Training Centres (CETCs) in South Africa.

THE SOUTH AFRICAN LITERATURE REVIEW²

2. This literature review examined the existing institutional forms that cater for the education and training needs of out-of-school, unemployed youth and of adults (including, but not limited to, public and private adult learning centres, public FET colleges, private FET institutions, NGOs, community-based organisations (CBOs) and faith-based organisations (FBOs)) in South Africa. The review further examined other “supplementary” institutions or agencies, two of which were discussed in some detail: the Sector Education and Training Authorities (SETAs) and the National Youth Development Agency (NYDA).
3. The approach adopted to achieve this review was to consolidate the sixteen topics in the original terms of reference into six broader ones, which were used to analyse the various institutional forms.
4. The first topic discussed the uniqueness and distinctiveness of the specific institutional forms and how many of them were operational, their provincial spread and footprint in communities. The second topic analysed their accessibility and the number of youth and adults they cater for. This section also discussed the capacity of the institutional forms to absorb large number of learners. The third topic outlined their programmes or qualifications, modes of delivery, issues of quality assurance and whether their programmes and qualifications’ articulate with those other educational institutions. The fourth topic addressed the relationship with and service to communities, business and industry. Essentially this section examined the institution’s responsiveness to the needs of the communities and business, in relation to graduate placement programmes. The fifth analysed the capacity of the institutions in terms of governance arrangements, institutional management, and general human resources (academic and support staff where applicable). The sixth and final section looked at how the institutions are funded and/or mobilize their own financial resources.
5. There is a plethora of legislation and plans establishing various forms of institutions meant to provide out-of-school youth and adults with education and training opportunities. These include, but not limited to the:
 - Adult Education and Training Act 52 of 2000
 - Further Education Training Act 16 of 2006
 - Further Education Training Section 78 Bill of 2011
 - New Institutional Landscape National Plan for FET Colleges in South Africa of 2008

2 Raphotle, 2012

- Higher Education Act 101 of 1997
6. The above legislation is the key policy framework meant to establish institutions which can absorb large number of youth and adults. There is other legislation, which is meant to contribute to the strengthening of the established institutions. These include the Skills Development Act 97 of 1998, its amendment Act 37 of 2008, the Skills Development Levy Act of 1999, the National Skills Development Strategy (NSDS) and the National Youth Development Agency Act 54 of 2008 and the Non-Profit Act 71 of 1997 which establishes the Directorate of Non-profit Organizations, which is meant to register non-profit organizations. The institutional forms arising from the legislation and policy framework are summarised in Tables 1 and 2 in Section 1.
 7. While the legislative and policy framework seems impressive on paper with regards to catering for out-of-school youth and adults, this target group continue to experience challenges in accessing education and training opportunities. One of the main problems of the post-school sector is its lack of diversity and the weakness of many of its institutions. Inadequate quality, quantity and diversity of provision characterise the post-school education sector as a whole.
 8. In response to the challenges, the South African literature reviewed identified four distinct institutional models and two supplementary models for the supply of education and training to youth and adults (see Table 1 and 2 above). The three institutional types that are singled out here for discussion and review are:
 - the Public Adult Learning Centre model;
 - the Public FET colleges model;
 - the Community colleges model; and

The Public Adult Learning Centre Model

9. Though there are a number of challenges highlighted and discussed in this review, there are valuable lessons learnt from some of the centres that have the infrastructure and resources. One such lesson is the use of disused schools and stand-alone government facilities and turning them into multipurpose adult education and training centres operating throughout the day. This will give the centres distinctive institutional identity. And with visionary leadership these mega-centres could establish small satellite centres within a 10km radius to minimise traveling by the learners. Existing implementation of this model is particularly evident in provinces such as a Gauteng, KwaZulu-Natal and Western Cape, where they are called community learning centres (CLCs). Some of these centres are established and managed by communities and registered with the department of education for funding and various kinds of support.
10. There are a number of advantages of this model. Firstly it is cheaper because of the use of existing infrastructure; disused schools and unused municipal facilities. Secondly it will give the community education and training centres an identity like the schools with distinct branding and signage. Thirdly it will anchor adult education and training within communities and give meaning to the concept of lifelong learning. Lastly it will increase the capacity of centres for easy access by the learners and the community at large.

11. As discussed in this review the key to the success of this model is adequate and sustainable funding to strengthen them in terms of human resources, infrastructure, the supply of educational materials and development of relevant curriculum.

The public FET Colleges model

12. The housing of Community Education and Training Centres (CETC) in the public FET Colleges is another viable option. This is because of their accessibility to all communities, especially rural communities. Most of them have an already existing infrastructure and in some cases facilities that can be utilised by the CETCs. Furthermore there is also a natural synergy that already exists between FET Colleges and adult education programmes in that they fall within level 1 and 4 of the NQF, which are quality assured by one quality assuring body, UMALUSI. Therefore, in theory, it should not be difficult for FET Colleges to extent their programmes to include AET and the proposed NASCA programmes. The linking of public FET colleges and CETC is one of the options proposed by the *Green Paper for Post-School Education and Training* (2012).
13. From the gleaned literature both institutions have a combined capacity of absorb more than 700 000 out-of-school, unemployed youth and of adults. Therefore this model, if well conceptualized, has a potential to offer this target group a viable alternative and option of accessing post school education and training programmes.
14. However, for this model to succeed the public FET Colleges will have to be capacitated in terms of the increase in the number and quality of human resources, especially lecturers and management; some in terms of facilities, an increase in the numbers classrooms; infrastructure such as laboratories and workshops; and provision of adequate funding. This will enable the colleges to increase their capacity to exceed the current theoretical capacity of 400 000 learners.

The Community College Model

15. This model incorporates parts of FET College and Community Learning Centre models. The community colleges are post school structures that seek to breach the gap between school and university, by offering programmes that lead either to employment, self employment or further study through a university or university of technology. They will offer adult education, academic and vocational programmes to enable learners to make a choice based on need and interest. Like FET Colleges the community colleges should have a great community reach and strong links with higher education institutions, business and industry. The current FET Colleges can be converted into Community Colleges, with strong links to Community Learning Centres and PALCs.
16. For the model to work, it will require major changes in legislation, infrastructure and curriculum re-configuration. These changes will take some time to be planned and implemented. While this will be an innovative approach that may address the challenges of youth and adult post-school education and training provision, it will require shifts in the current post-school institutional landscape. The model will also require new public funding

over a two decade period to implement.

THE INTERNATIONAL LITERATURE³

17. This review, as per its brief, looked at institutional forms for lifelong learning described in the international literature that could be seen as appropriate for use or adaptation in the South African situation. The literature survey examined highly developed, middle-income and developing countries with a special focus on the United States of America, the Scandinavian countries and South Korea (among the highly developed countries), Brazil, Russia, India, and China (the so-called BRIC countries) and on Botswana as a developing country. Two other countries – Cuba and Venezuela were also studied. The review also summarised the United Kingdom’s 2011 Review of Vocational Education (the Wolf Report).
18. Various aspects of the institutional forms considered were viewed: the terminology used about them, the policies that establish them, their governance, administration, and cross-sectoral articulation, their funding, how they were staffed and managed, what kind of provision they were used to implement, and how qualifications, assessment of learning, and evaluation of impact took place.

The issue of terminology

19. Though it is common cause that South Africa has a massive need for adult education to serve people who had not benefited (at all or fully) from initial formal schooling and tertiary education, there is much terminological confusion about what exactly is adult or community education. Looked at broadly, adult education is a very, very big field – virtually everything that is not clearly and narrowly definable as time limited, initial, formal schooling, further education, and higher education (or tertiary or post-secondary).
20. Common answers on what adult education is can range from any education given to people considered to be adults (as UNESCO would have it) to literacy and adult basic education. Currently there is increasing pressure to include young people in “adult” education (even though they may be out-of-school children). Hence the recent tendency, particularly in Africa to talk about Youth and Adult Education to include both older adults and young people who are definitely out-of-school or out-of-further or tertiary education but need further education and training. The latter group is the subject of growing national and international concern because of the reality of the huge numbers of youth who are “Not Employed or in Education and Training” (the NEETs) who are seen as a potential source of political and economic instability.
21. In revamping the South African adult education system there is a need for a rapid clarification and standardisation of the terminology and concepts relating to youth and adult education to enable comparability of data and to help coordination of and collaboration in the field.

3 Aitchison, 2012

Policy frameworks

22. The existence of adult education policies indicates that a country recognises the importance of, and shows an explicit political commitment to providing the resources for, the education of adults as a means towards achieving social, cultural or economic development or other goals. Most countries have some form of adult education policy – what varies is the extent to which they are identifiable as such and are comprehensive in nature.
23. Policies themselves are expressions of purposes which will determine legislation, governance and administrative structures, resource allocations and practices. In respect of youth and adult education, these purposes, as expressed in policies tend to be either for empowerment (whether democratic or individual) or instrumental (for social or economic change and development), though often both types appear in policy documents, the empowerment discourse often tends to be there mainly for rhetorical or aspirational embellishment.
24. Increasingly policies on adult education are being justified by the evidence that literate and better educated youth and adults of all ages can improve their life chances, standards of living, and occupationally-based social status and are more able to protect their health, avoid sexually-transmitted diseases and to take care of their own children (and improve their educational prospects). At a more macro level, estimates of the costs of illiteracy and under-education (in terms of lost productivity) to countries as a whole have generated astounding figures for the annual loss to the GDP: Ecuador and the Dominican Republic (US\$25 billion), the State of São Paulo in Brazil (US\$209 billion), and South Africa (US\$68 billion).
25. Generally, and understandably, adult education policies in poorer countries tend to focus on literacy and basic education, whereas developed countries have moved into a broader lifelong learning framework. However, some South-East Asian countries with well-performing economies are making a ‘policy jump’ from adult education as adult literacy and basic skills towards adult education within a lifelong learning policy framework as seen in places like South Korea and China where there has been the development of comprehensive adult education policies (as adult education is seen as the necessary condition for the development of modern society and economy and the progress of science and technology) and regular national five-year plans.

Constitutional and Legislative support

26. A number of countries have some kind of constitutional reference to youth and adult education as a right and that this should be the basis for any adult education policies. The *African statement on the power of youth and adult learning and education for Africa's development* made at the CONFINTEA VI Preparatory Conference in Nairobi in 2008 states that the comprehensive national youth and adult education policies and action plans that every country should have “should be backed by legislation”. The international literature shows that some countries have a number of pieces of *ad hoc* legislation (often related to funding) and others, particularly those that have a lifelong learning vision, have comprehensive acts, such as the Republic of Korea.

27. The international literature examined suggests that having well articulated, officially ratified, comprehensive adult education policies (allied to strategic plans of some substance) is a one of the criteria associated with successful adult education systems, as is comprehensive legislation (and not just *ad hoc* funding legislation with short term goals) is similarly an indicator of the sound health of a robust system. South African policies on adult education have been very narrowly focussed on adult basic education and general adult education legislation is virtually non-existent.

Institutional forms and their articulation across sectors

28. The international literature shows that the institutional forms used for the management and provision of youth and adult education have some commonality with (including sometimes articulation with) the regular educational institutional types – in other words the forms are quite conventional. The difference lies in the right and means of access to these institutions. The literature survey found little evidence of unique institutional forms for youth and adult education provision (except perhaps for the Scandinavian study circles system). What was different related to how easy it was to access them and how well they articulated with the conventional education system.
29. Some findings that can be made are:
- Where adult education is governed by multiple ministries, inter-ministerial committees of real substance seem to be a feature of successful adult education systems.
 - Many countries have multiple institutional forms of both formal and non-formal adult education all fully funded or subsidised by the state. There is a wide range of sub-systems or modes of adult education provision.
 - Clearly in such a situation of variegated institutional forms, governance and administration are complex and require well managed systems of articulation.
30. By contrast South Africa has only overtly supported one narrow component of adult education (adult basic education), though it has a qualification and standards system designed to facilitate articulation it is clear that there remain considerable difficulties, and it is not clear at all that there is active inter-ministerial collaboration on adult education.

Governance

31. Institutional governance arrangements tend to fall into two streams. The one (no doubt influenced by the triumph of market fundamentalism and significant growth of democratisation in the world), has argued against centralised command and control governance in favour of decentralization policies often with very mixed results where there has been a delegation of responsibilities (and unfunded mandates) rather than of decision-making). The second stream (based more on the evaluations of failed implementations) has warned about the necessity for good coordination (particularly in a multi-sectoral domain such as adult education). The two answers are, of course, in tension with each other. The one call is for greater devolution, decentralisation both organisational and financial, and even autonomy, accompanied by public consultation, consultation arrangements and partnership

with civil society. The other call is for more regulation, monitoring and quality control by central government administrations.

32. In the highly developed world adult education provision tends to be done by civil society organisations funded by government. Indeed in a number of countries private sector and non-governmental adult education provision is legislatively protected from undue state interference. In the developing world where the priority targets of adult education are large masses of people (and sometimes even a majority of adults) the arguments for (central) state control (and therefore the institutional forms congruent with this) have more salience. If governments feel compelled to provide formal certificated school equivalency adult education (because all citizens, of whatever age, need to have attained at least the level of compulsory schooling) and also view adult education as an integral part of a policy of lifelong learning, then the growth of state control and funding become almost inevitable. But it also needs to be noted that as the developing countries (notable the BRIC ones) strive to become modern middle-income countries, their adult education provision moves away from an original focus on basic literacy towards continuing and lifelong learning and there is consequently a need for the more varied institutional forms (and governance models) associated with continuing education in a complex society.
33. The main patterns are as follows:
 - a substantial department or departments within an education ministry (or equivalent)
 - relatively independent authority or agency (though often under the formal control of a ministry)
 - delegation of responsibility to local agencies (either of government or civil society).
34. The international evidence looked at shows that the successful adult education systems have governance and planning nodes of some substance at both national and state/regional level and that they have a good degree of autonomy from the more conventional schooling bureaucracy. In many cases the more operational institutes or centres are paralleled (also at various levels) by inter-ministerial and stakeholder representative councils.
35. By contrast South Africa's adult education governance of adult education has been characterised by the retention of under-resourced low status sub-sections of the formal school education bureaucracy at national and provincial levels with little policy, planning or implementation capacity. The one major success in recent years, the *Kha Ri Gude* adult literacy campaign, had a degree of such autonomy.

Staffing and management

36. There are two main issues here that are particularly important in the developing world: the training of practitioners (and their professionalisation) and their conditions of service,.
37. The situation is beset with the treble problem of insufficient supply (partly because of insufficient practitioner development institutions), poor career prospects (partly because of the way formal schooling bureaucracies manage staffing of adult education), and, particularly for the lower level practitioners, poor conditions of service. The need for a larger professional cadre of qualified adult educator practitioners (and managers) is an international one. In many countries adult education is going through a process of

professionalisation as the only sure way that the adult and continuing education can claim its rightful place as a respectable sector in the education field.

38. South Africa is beset with all these problems, now made worse by the crass dismantling by university administrations of the modest infrastructure of adult education departments at universities and the threats of closure of the excellent Higher Certificate programmes run by some of them (the legacy of which was crucial for the staffing of the *Kha Ri Gude* campaign).
39. Brazil has a particularly interesting model for staffing its AlfaSol literacy and adult basic education programme where partnering higher education institutions train a new batch of educators for each six-month programme cycle from the communities targeted. Those who have been through the training are encouraged to then enroll for formal teacher training and entering the mainstream system of teaching. The model of teacher training offers extensive pre-service and in-service support and has proved to be successful and well monitored and evaluated. The transfer of teacher capacity from the campaign to mainstream/formal teaching situations can be regarded as a way of capitalising on the training and experience of these teachers.

Qualifications and the Qualifications Authorities

40. A National Qualifications Framework (NQF) can be seen as an organizing principle for both formal and non-formal education within the perspective of lifelong learning. In developing countries they can be seen as providing the necessary framework to enable people with low levels of basic education to gain validation of what basic learning they have (formal or non-formal) and to go beyond it. In the context of global competition, work mobility and the new knowledge economy, adult learners have to be able to move beyond the mere communal validation of knowledge to a more public and national system of validation that allows them to access further opportunities to develop new, wider and more complex competencies both nationally and transnationally.
41. The move to have National Qualifications Frameworks is likely to sweep Africa in the next decade, a perhaps inevitable consequence of globalization and the internationalisation of standards in education and training. South Africa, with its all encompassing National Qualifications Framework has, of course, played a leading role in these African developments.
42. However, the pre-CONFINTEA VI sub-Saharan Africa report, *The development and state of the art of adult learning and education (ALE)* has expressed certain cautions about national qualification frameworks as beneficial to adult education:
 - The intellectual technology of level descriptors, unit standards, specific outcomes, assessment criteria, cross-field outcomes, etc. is complicated and often mystifying (contrary to the rational intentions of a NQF) and it takes an inordinate amount of training to equip an educator or trainer to understand what the unit standards require and how to apply them in the learning environment.
 - The effort required to develop standards and courses and qualifications based upon them and to be registered as a provider is incredibly resource intensive. Those resources go inevitably towards the mainstream and profitable sections of the education and training

enterprise. NGOs providing adult education tend to be further marginalised in such a set up.

- Many unit standards have exit levels that are over ambitious and become formidable and unachievable obstacles to further learning.
- Integration and moving between academic and vocational qualifications and between formal education and the world of work remain difficult.
- Not all adult learners want accreditation. Many come to learn focussed skills, yet it is becoming increasingly difficult for providers to gain resources for other than so-called accredited programmes.

The process of implementing the recognition of prior learning (RPL) is proving to be complicated and cumbersome and more work must be done to render it “operational”, particularly on any meaningful scale. Problems with regard to the RPL relate to its inaccessibility (and the self-interested refusal of educational providers to engage with it).

- A NQF encourages the overwhelming dominance of a discourse of standards and certification that, quite literally, renders formal most education and training provision which can have dire consequences for genuine non-formal education and its providers.

The issue of the recognition of prior learning

43. In modern societies recognised educational qualifications are a crucial factor in career advancement. It therefore becomes a matter of importance that people understand how qualification systems function and how their knowledge, skills and experience can be validated (including through the recognition of prior learning). The Republic of Korea has an Academic Credit Bank System administered under the Act on Credit Recognition and Others, with an aim to formally recognize the diversity of learning outcomes and qualifications attained outside school boundaries, and confer degrees to individual adult learners who have successfully earned and accumulated a required amount of credits (many of them earned through government-approved courses at junior colleges or universities). There is also a limited curriculum Bachelor's degree for self-education (by examination only). In India certification has been introduced via the equivalency programme of the National Institute of Open Schooling and a few State Institutes of Open Schooling for neo literates and other groups of the National Literacy Movement. China has a Self-taught examination system which offers national examinations in diplomas. It had about 9.6 million candidates in 2007.

44. In South Africa it is clear that recognition of prior learning is not functioning well (indeed hardly at all) and there are huge vested interests (particularly in higher education) inhibiting easy access and the rational accumulation and transfer of credits. This has a particularly harmful impact on poorer students starting their higher education career with Higher Certificates and Diplomas.

Provision and its modes

45. A striking commonality in the literature is that the big and successful delivery systems have a wide range of programme in both type and mode of delivery and, because of the complexity of the field, various degrees of devolution. They do not put all their eggs in one basket.

46. There is not much evidence of any new innovative alternatives in provision for youth and adult education. What leads to success is not any particular type or mode of provision. What is crucial is that there are bodies or nodes of governance for whom adult education provision is their sole concern, adequate funding, ease of access (in every sense) to learners, and rigorous assessment, monitoring, and evaluation.
47. Some interesting individual point from the literature survey included:
- Programmes for male youth may need special attention as the evidence is piling up that, once there is a degree of sexual equality in access to conventional schooling and higher education, that males will comprise the majority of the undereducated in our society.
 - Popular local education centres in communities seem to work well in many countries.
 - The potential for distance education (and including open access institutions) is huge.
 - A sole focus on literacy and adult basic education is a mistake – adult secondary and continuing education must be a priority too.
 - Adult education through municipalities is very common.
 - A greater range of post-schooling qualifications is helpful, including two year (foundation and bridging degrees.)
48. State funding of provision tends to be directed at special target groups and (unfortunately, often tends to be ad hoc and short term) as in the United States of America where the main types of fundamental provision that are beneficiaries of state funding are adult literacy, adult basic and adult secondary education and English as a second language. Non-profit providers (whether state, private sector, religious bodies or NGOs) are contracted according to clear criteria and performance agreements (which include formal assessment of learning outcomes and in some cases job placement), but there is no standardisation on educational approaches, the detailed curriculum, etc. Another area strongly supported by state funding is post-secondary education, mainly via programmes that increase access to post-secondary education for disadvantaged students by strengthening the capacity of colleges and universities that serve a high percentage of disadvantaged students, and provide teacher and student development resources. What is of note in the United States system is the wide variety of institutions available: technical or vocational institution, 2-year community or junior colleges, and 4-year colleges and universities. The delivery system is therefore very diverse with both credit and non-credit offerings in all the vocational fields. The main provider institutions are community colleges and technical colleges and other provider such as business and industry associations, unions, and for-profit educational institutions.
49. Sweden has a comprehensive but variegated set of formal and non-formal provision, adult basic, secondary and vocational education and training offered by municipalities and immensely popular non-formal education through associations of study circles and folk high schools. Funding is both directly by the state (mainly via municipalities) and via civil society associations (which are subsidized by the state).
50. In the Republic of Korea providers include registered lifelong education facilities, corporate bodies, and groups as well as registered private teaching institutes and some non-formal education providers. The current government has also launched schemes to nurture selected higher education institutions into leading providers of lifelong learning programmes for the regional community.

51. In Brazil most youth and adult education is done at municipal level but is typically funded and managed overall through national programmes of the state or the private sector. A good example is the National Inclusion Programme for Young People which assists young people aged between 18 and 29 with low levels of education and without formal jobs who were living in state capitals and a number of urban regions, offering them the chance to finish their primary education integrated with vocational training and community action in an 18 month programme that includes finishing their primary education, computer literacy, and qualifications in three jobs within a range of similar occupations. They can also develop a community action project and formulate a plan for their further vocational training. There is a similar, though smaller project, that works with rural youth.
52. The aging of Russia's population has been paralleled by a growth in continuing adult education on which the Russian adult education system focuses. There is a unified system of continuing education at over 2,000 educational institutions and 1,000 on the job training sites.
53. India, since independence, has tended to prioritise literacy instruction as the main form of adult education. The main delivery point is at Continuing Education Centres that are staffed by an Administrator and function as a library, reading room, training and information site, venue for cultural, sports and discussion events. The Continuing Education Centre is seen as a permanent institution, located in a public place and open to all." A major role is played by NGOs and many NGOs offer adult basic education programmes with support from these centres (though such support is in some cases restricted to narrowly defined adult basic education).
54. China claims to have the biggest and most-diversified adult education system in the world. It has a large number of colleges, universities, secondary, junior high and primary schools solely dedicated to adults (nearly 60,000 institutions in all) though the Chinese system focuses mainly on post-secondary training and continuing education for the employed.
55. The following different approaches to education and training provision to adult and youth is worth highlighting:
 - The broad range diploma and degree qualifications in the United States of America.
 - The open access to provision and examinations (the latter sometimes being totally free (as in Brazil for the National Examination for Certification of Youth and Adults)). Of note is China's Self-taught examination system for diplomas.
 - Community learning centres are common in Asia and have been set up to provide flexible programmes for adults and include reading spaces and computer facilities, thus providing a literate environment at community level.
 - Small libraries that are in essence small multi-purpose community centres.
 - One-Stop Career Centres to provide information to job seekers and access to a broad range of employment and training services.
 - Mobile education centres (in medium sized buses).
 - Distance and ICT-based e-learning (with China's Ministry of Education's arguing that modern distance education is a necessity for the construction of an open network for education and the system of lifelong education in the age of the knowledge-based economy).

Assessment

56. There is a clear international trend for assessment to be taken much more seriously (parallel to what has happened in conventional schooling and post-school education and training). For assessment that leads to certification, the major issue has been on the nature of the equivalence of such certification to that of the formal initial education and training system.
57. The United States of America is particularly interesting because of the institution of the General Education Development (GED) examinations which are equivalent to the high school diploma. It is almost universally recognised by employers as equivalent to a high school diploma and successful candidates generally improve their earning capacity. Clearly it is important that any open access second chance adult examination system must not dysfunctionally provide an incentive for high schools to extrude students as drop-outs. Two ways of preventing this are to make sure that the standard is not easier but more rigorous than that of the equivalent level of schooling and to set a minimum entrance age. The former principle is advocated in a number of countries as is seen in the Chinese slogan “easier entrance and stricter exam marking schemes”. This practice helps avoid the danger of adult education qualifications being seen as inferior to schooling ones. It can be argued that South Africa’s new National Adult Senior Certificate (NASCA) should have very rigorous assessment. In Brazil there is the National Examination for Certification of Youth and Adults which is an assessment instrument offered free to people who have not had the opportunity to finish their studies at the proper age.

Quality assurance: monitoring, evaluation and research

58. Quality assurance can be seen as combining the verification of the assessment of learning outcomes, the monitoring of adult education programmes and the evaluation, both institutional and programmatic, of adult education provision. Research can be seen as undergirding all aspects of quality assurance.
59. The evidence is clear that healthy youth and adult education systems have good monitoring, evaluation and research and that all of these require excellent flows of accurate data. Universities, and departments of adult education in them, play a particularly important part such work.
60. Of particular note are the twelve benchmarks developed by the Global Campaign for Education in 2005 for monitoring adult literacy provision and the Literacy Assessment and Monitoring Programme (LAMP) run by the UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS) since 2003 and piloted in a number of countries. Another interesting initiative is the Programme for the International Assessment of Adult Competencies (PIAAC) managed by the OECD and currently being implemented in 27 countries in Europe, the Americas and Asia, the results of which will be available at the end of 2013.
61. Research capacity is a necessary component of any healthy education system. It is equally clear that the more successful adult education systems have such research capacity, though there remain considerable difficulties associated with the data required for research studies. Also, most countries with effective adult education systems have a signal role for

universities as research and policy resources for the system, but the African statement expresses great concern at the lack of recognition of the role of universities in adult education and South Africa has seen a virtual demolition of the university-based adult education that existed in the 1990s.

62. Data supply is an ongoing problem in adult education, made worse by the variegated nature of the field. The South Africa's Department of Education's and now the DHET continue to years struggle to gain reliable data on the public adult learning centres. But data can be generated, swiftly and efficiently, as the *Kha Ri Gude* adult literacy campaign has demonstrated. Future funding for all implementation should resolutely be dependent on good data flows.

Relationship with and service to communities and civil society

63. Most of the current international literature on adult education system is curiously silent on the issue of relationships with and service to communities, business and industry (including graduate placement programmes). This is no doubt partly explained by the dominance of a fairly instrumentalist approach to adult education internationally and in South Africa. It is an approach that has led to formal adult education in South Africa missing out on the vital importance of adult education's social mission.

Funding

64. Of the state of funding arrangements for adult education in Africa the Nairobi statement, argued that youth and adult education is seldom viewed as an investment rather than simply as an expenditure and that the costing of adult education requires adequate needs assessment, research data, and accurate budgeting.
65. The sources of adult education funding are:
- Public monies, much expended via ministries of education but in reality there is considerable spend by most ministries (though it is normally poorly documented) either centrally or via decentralised or local budgets,
 - Foreign aid (some public, some from international organisations) which may in many cases be indistinguishable from public funding if the foreign aid is directed through the government,
 - Private financing (from the private or corporate sector),
 - Civil society financing (civil society support to adult learning and education (e.g. religious institutions, unions, NGOs)
 - Private donor financing
 - Learner contributions (through tuition fees and other charges).

There are considerable variations in how public monies are distributed.

66. In the United States of America legislated federal funding is disbursed via each state competitively to eligible non-profit providers – community-based organizations, faith-based organisations, literacy organizations, community, junior or technical colleges, institutions of

higher education, correctional institutions, libraries and other public or private nonprofit institutions, using quality criteria identified in the respective legislation. There is strict performance accountability requirements via a National Reporting System. For some funding, state agencies have to provide some percentage of matching funding. Problems with this funding model arise mainly from the onerous data collection and management burden that is part of the accountability measures.

67. In Sweden the state finances adult education through state grants in the form of general government grants to municipalities plus the municipalities themselves providing facilities and subsidies to study circle associations.
68. In the Republic of Korea funding comes nationally from the Ministry of Education and Human Resource Development but mainly from metropolitan and provincial budgets. The corporate sector also plays an important role in funding vocational and workplace training. There are also over 188,750 private teaching institutes, the total expenditure of which is over seven times the government's total lifelong education budget and which is extremely profitable.
69. Brazil's funding of adult education has, at times been hampered by the problem of unfunded mandates. The fact that public adult education is not allowed to charge fees (though it is allowed in the private sector) is a major factor here. Government grants go 60% to states and 40% to municipalities, some of which is in term disbursed to contracted NGOs.
70. Generally all countries report an insufficiency in the budget allocations for adult education. Several countries now have a skills levy system for vocational and technical training.

Equity adjustments in funding

71. Some countries have means of adjusting funding so that disadvantaged and poor regions or groups of people receive preferential support.
72. In the United States of America the Adult Education and Family Literacy Act grants to each state vary according to the ratio of adults with less than a high school diploma level of education. A similar provision based on a ratio of adults ages 16 and older who do not have a high school diploma and are not enrolled in secondary school. applies to grants from Workforce Investment Act of 1998.
73. In Sweden the government grants aim to equalise inequalities between all municipalities and county councils.
74. In Brazil funding of adult education in municipalities is weighed according to the poverty of the area. No fees may be charged for public provision. A number of federally funded institutions now have to reserve a percentage of their places for youth and adult learners. In Brazil the apportionment of the funding for the state level structures of the National Literacy Mission is done according to the level of illiteracy and under-education in the various states.
75. It is clear that South Africa faces the same problem of most countries – getting sufficient funding to meet the estimated need. Positively South Africa already has a skills levy, a

growing phenomenon internationally, though how it is distributed may be a point for action. Inter-ministerial coordination is both a challenge and a promising area in respect of funding.

76. It is also clear that in many countries the granting and continuation of funding is much more rigorously based upon competition amongst providers and well monitored performance.
77. Many countries have much better regulation of the distribution of funding in an equitable way. One notes that there continue to be enormous disparities between the provinces in state adult basic education spend in South Africa.
78. It seems common adult education practice for no tuition fees to be charged for basic adult education.

SUBMISSIONS AND ENGAGEMENTS WITH STAKEHOLDERS

79. The CETC Task Team received the following inputs from and engage with the following stakeholders and processes during the period of its operations:

- *The draft Post-school Green Paper*, by Mr. John Pampallis from the Ministry of Higher Education. 1 August 2011.
- *The General and Further Education and Training Qualifications Framework* presented by Ms L. Burroughs on behalf of Umalusi. 5 September 2011.
- A presentation on the *Quality Council for Trades and Occupations* by Ms. Adrienne Bird. 5 September 2011.
- *Training programmes and challenges within the Expanded Public Works Programme*, by Ms. Tsholofelo Pooe from the EPWP Training division. 5 September 2011.
- The Kha Ri Gude Literacy campaign in South Africa, presentation by Prof. John Aitchison. 3 October 2011.
- *Increasing access to post-schooling: can open and distance learning contribute?* By Ms Jenny Glenny, Ms Maryla Bialobrzaska and Mr. Paul Mphisa from the South African Institute for Distance Education (SAIDE). 7 November 2011.
- *The National Planning Commission Human resource development vision process* by Ms. Carmel Marock. 3 October 2011.
- *Adult education and training within the context of the NQF*, presentation by Mr. Samuel Isaacs and Mr. James Keevy from SAQA. 7 November 2011.
- *Preliminary issues arising from the Audit of the Performance of Public Adult Learning Centres* by Ms Gratitude Ramphaka and Mr. Alec Green from the Office of the Auditor General. 7 November 2011.
- *Status of youth and their education and training needs*, Mr. B. Magongo and Ms. N Makaula from the National Youth Development Agency. 7 November 2011
- *Education as a public and social good for everyone*, by Dr. Peliwe Lolwana from the Wits EPU. 5 December 2011.
- Meeting with Advocate Boshoff, DHET on the *Further Education and Training College Act Amendment Bill* on 20 February 2012.
- *SMME Entrepreneurial development* – by Mr. Thami Skenjana, Mr. Brandon Young, Mr. Claude Oosthuizen and Ms. Zandile Moerana from the Southern African Council on Cooperatives (SACOC). 5 March 2012.
- *Lessons from the experiences of the National Initiative on Community College Education (NICE) and the Funda Centre*, by Mr. Mokaba Mokgatle and Mr. Motsumi Makhene on 12 March 2012.

Section 3

COMMUNITY RESEARCH

1. The Task Team commissioned community research, that were conducted in local communities in the provinces of KZN, Limpopo and Gauteng. The purpose of the community research was to:
 - Develop an understanding of the education and training issues facing local communities
 - Views from target groups (youth and adults) of their education needs.
 - The views from education and training institutions of their roles in relation to adult and youth education
2. The summary findings of the research are as follows, as well as the implications for the brief of the Task Team:
- 3.

4. In addition to the Community research, we here also include in table form examples of different Community Learning Centre types, based on other research, Task Team member inputs and desktop research.

Table 6. Examples of existing Community Learning Centres by Institution type

Note: these examples are by no means exhaustive, but illustrative of current approaches.

Type	Examples
Public Adult Learning Centres upgraded in some way	<i>Various attempts to upgrade PALCs into genuine community learning centres, but limited and not sustainable due to reliance on foreign donor funding.</i> Umzinyathi Community Education Centre: A KZN DoE facility in Dundee, that functions as a PALC, offering ABET and Senior Certificate programmes, plus a small library with internet access. It uses the facility of a substantial site of a closed down former teachers training college, with facilities such as a life sciences lab for local school use, and classrooms used for workshops and tutorials for distance education programmes by Unisa and UKZN. Sijonga-Phambili Community Learning Centre: established in 1985 in Houtbay, gained own premises in 2002 and offers ABET and SC classes, together with some limited skills training. It has a full-time centre manager. Siyabuswa Educational and Development Improvement Trust: A multi-purpose centre with two satellite centres that grew out of a high school tuition project. With donor funding it has become something of a ICT hub with strong support from neighbouring universities (which also leads to it being well researched). The project is hosted at a community centre with two computer labs. It provides ABET training, training in computer literacy to school children, adult learners and the rest of the community. It is said to have strong community support, regarded as a place of excellence.
Company based Private Adult Learning Centres	<i>Provide formal ABET classes to workers out of pressures from unions in the 1980s. Mainly located in industrial or business settings as part of worker upgrading programmes. Usually well managed, resourced and staffed. Many only open to employees, though some open to surrounding community based on available space.</i> Adult learning centres operating in the Mining sector: <i>Baseline study of ABET in the Mining and Minerals Sector: Improving provision and delivery</i> (Baatjes, Aitchison and John, 2002) gave a good sense of these centres in the mining sector, at that time almost 20% of companies had their own private centres, offering basic home language literacy, numeracy and English language, with programmes either part of full-time.
Community based Private Adult Learning Centres	<i>These two examples of adult learning centres provide formal ABET and SC classes, but are more comprehensive in scope:</i> St. Francis Adult Education Centre (Langa, Cape Town, W Cape): well-known, centered around a large day, night and weekend school serving about 4000 adult learners annually with well over 100 educators. Operates from 10h00-16h00 daily, teaching ABET and Senior Certificate courses, as well as a range of skills programmes including computer literacy, sewing, fashion design, music and drivers license. St Francis also runs a tertiary level Technology Education Training programme. Fees for adult programmes less than R120 per year per learner. Fairly comprehensive facilities and projects and programmes including: a church, pre-school, computer training and resource centre, a fashion design school, a driving school, a disabled rehabilitation centre, a day and night school. In addition it also runs a school feeding scheme, a refugee language programme, pensioner and scouts clubs and serves as pay-out point for social grants. Tembaletu Community Education Centre (Pietermaritzburg, KZN): serves both the city and the surrounding areas. Facilities include a public reading room and a specialist reference library housing educational materials and texts for ABET, school and university learners anchored by the Resource Information Centre and an HIV counseling and testing unit. Other programmes are run by nine other NGOs housed at the centre, these include: career counseling; study skills training; food garden training; human rights, democracy and development training for youth; ABET and Secondary education classes; second language communications courses, and a wide range of ad hoc skills training and organisational development courses and workshops. Share Adult Learning Centre (Helderberg, W Cape): served communities in area since 1990, in addition to ABET and Senior certificate classes, also some skills training in sewing and computer skills, and a community development project using REFLECT approach. Serves as administrative office for the Adult Learning Forum, an association in the province.

Type	Examples
Community Learning Centres hosted by NGOs	<i>These are training centres for the host NGO, usually focussing on a specific sector and expanded into other education programmes:</i> The Valley Trust: Started in 1953 providing health services and has moved into small scale agricultural development. Mainly serves local community, but also training facility for participatory rural health and development workers. Khululeka Community Education Centre: Supports mainly early childhood development by training ECD practitioners. They also have a small computer unit with internet based adult literacy and numeracy programmes for use by trainees with limited basic education. Hantam Community Education Trust (Colesburg, W Cape): In existence for 22 years, started as pre-school facility for children of farm workers, expanded to a school, ECD programme, parenting programme, youth empowerment training, a health outreach and HIV education support programme, INSET training for teachers and a primary health care clinic and pharmacy. Tshwane Community Learning Centre (Onderstepoort, Gauteng): NGO started in 1987 as an early childhood development centre, now provides formal schooling, homes for destitute children, primary health care and a small skills training and in-come generation centre. Kgautswane Community Development Centre: Established in 1994 to foster development projects in the community, focussing on rural development. At some point programmes ran from centre include orphan and vulnerable children care, sewing, crafts, post-making, fencing, brick-making, poultry, piggery, food gardens, shoe repairs, a village bank, a library, a computer centre, a retail post office, creches and tourism. Commonwealth Learning report in 2005 found many of these programmes poorly functioning and little integration.
Community service centres with education add-ons by NGOs	<i>Many NGOs, in addition to a core service also provide community education programmes from their centres/offices. Many of these are HIV/Aids and Health NGOs, because of the impact of the HIV pandemic, many 'community education centres' have a core focus on health education, but also run other programmes:</i> Clouds of Hope (Underberg, W Cape): in addition to direct AIDS education work and an orphanage, also run vocational classes to empower women in the community. Woza Moya (near Ixopo, KZN): in addition to HIV community care and support programmes also provide services in areas of home-based care, youth and child care, ECD, food security, paralegal services, youth and social media. Also have field staff who work in communities. Hillcrest Aids Centre Trust (Hillcrest, KZN): home-based care, horticultural, and craft production for income generation as add-ons. Refilwe Community Project (near Lenasia, Gauteng): started as a primary health care clinic, which incorporated home based care and TB management programmes, a hospice, school and shelter for abandoned children. Expanded with a national NGO to provide enterprise development programmes: life skills training, business support, including to day care centres, sewing groups, gardening groups, an internet cafe, and skills like beadwork, crafts and ceramics.
Multi-purpose Community Centres (MPCCs)	<i>Multi-purpose centres are primarily information and service orientated, with information, facilities, training and service made available by providers sharing the same space in a cost effective manner. They range from centres that provide services that include community services, government service centers, resource centres, ICT telecentres, entrepreneurship and small business development centres. The mainly non-governmental MPCCs are not very sustainable. Also include the 149 government's Thusong Centres, with its six-block service model:</i> 1. Government social and admin services: grants, housing, personal documents 2. Office services: phone, fax, copy, print, DTP, postal services. 3. Education and skills development services: ABET, FET, specialised training 4. LED services: small business advise and development 5. Business services and community opportunities: SME enterprises, other private sector services such as retail and ATMs 6. Information and communication activities: government information and on-site guidance regarding services, community information and awareness.
Trade union and worker education centres	<i>Trade unions – like other social movements - historically have always included a strong component of education and training in their work. The following are examples</i> Elijah Barayi Memorial Training Centre: established in 1993 by the National Union of Mineworkers, it is a residence-based training facility, teaching trade union and leadership skills. In addition the centre also developed and offer a range of certificated courses in such areas as computer training, basic economics, business writing. The centre trains about 500 workers per year, mainly NUM members. A second centre linked to the Elijah Barayi centre was opened in Midrand in 2010. Both funded by the Mineworkers Investment Trust and it operates as a section 21, not-for-profit. Mineworkers Development Agency: has seven Development Centres across the country, including one in Lesotho. The Development Centres provide enterprise development and business skills, as well as

Type	Examples
	retraining opportunities for retrenched mineworkers. An impact assessment of the DC conducted in 2000 indicated that a high proportion of trainees use the entrepreneurial training to start and continue with projects. (Phillip, 2000) Ditsela and the Workers College:
Community college-like institutions	The NICE initiative advocated for the adoption of the Community college model, learning mainly from the US model, but also experiences of community college 'type' or 'like' institutions already in existence. The examples of the Funda Centre in Soweto and the Khanya Colleges are the obvious in this regard:

PROPOSALS ON A 'NEW' INSTITUTIONAL MODEL

Assumptions

1. The proposals on a new institutional model for post-school provisioning to adults and youth learners are based on the following underlying normative and empirical assumptions⁴:
 - (a) Literate and better educated youth and adults of all ages can improve their life chances, standards of living, and occupationally-based social status and are more able to protect their health, avoid sexually-transmitted diseases and to take care of their own children (and improve their educational prospects).
 - (b) Education is one of the key contributors to equality and social mobility, adult and youth education are therefore critical to the development of opportunities for all.
 - (c) At a more macro level, estimates of the costs of illiteracy and under-education (in terms of lost productivity) to countries as a whole have generated astounding figures for the annual loss to the GDP. Skills shortages also impact on competitiveness, general development and entrepreneurial capabilities and raise the cost of critical skills.
 - (d) The community education and training paradigm internationally represents an approach to adult learning that seeks to facilitate a cycle of lifelong learning in communities and offering pathways to enable the development of skills, (including literacy, numeracy and communication) and to enhance personal, social, family and employment experiences. It further seeks to assist community organisations, local government, industry and individuals to work together to develop and enhance their communities, by building on their existing knowledge and skills.
 - (e) Adult education provision should move away from a narrow focus on basic literacy towards continuing and lifelong learning and consequently a need for the more varied institutional forms (and governance models) associated with continuing education in a complex society.
 - (f) Many young people participate in school education, more young people than ever before remain in schools until the age of 18 years, with knock-on effects on the labour market. However, many still drop out before completion of high school education. Youth unemployment has been rising even during the boom years that before the 2008 financial crisis and global recession, and the labour market has become egg-shaped (i.e. not only the traditional few jobs at the high-skilled end, but increasingly fewer jobs at the unskilled end). Many jobs once open to 18 year olds are now 'graduate entry' without having changed substantially.
 - (g) Good English and Mathematics continue to be the most generally useful and valuable vocational skill on offer and a precondition for accessing selective, demanding and desirable courses, both vocational and academic.

⁴ Section draws from the International literature review (Aitchison, 2012) and the input by Dr. Lolwana (2012) to the Task Team.

- (h) Non-formal and popular education play an important role in community and individual development and empowerment; and can therefore contribute to social cohesion, participatory democracy and sustainable communities.
 - (i) Industrialisation and now the knowledge economy is putting a prime on post-secondary education for most economies and expansion of this has become essential. Thus the growing realisation that completion of upper secondary education by citizens is a necessary requirement for preparing them for the socio-economic, technological and socio-political challenges of the world. Furthermore, increasingly more and more technical and vocational capabilities are required at the post-secondary education levels.
 - (j) Improvements in the quality, provision of and participation in adult education can accelerate progress towards meeting all the MDGs. Parental education and qualifications – especially those of mothers – are positively associated with children's health and educational participation and attainment. Adults of all ages who continue to participate in education have greater access to key social and political issues, that are important for forming views and taking action with respect to key social and political issues.
 - (k) Thus a fast-changing world in terms of knowledge, technology, labour market and information, it is no longer enough to only educate the young, citizens of all ages have to deal with a changing country and world.
2. In addition to the above, which reflects global trends, there are further domestic arguments for a different adult and youth education approach in South Africa:
- General upward trend of young people staying longer in education:
 - Increased participation rates in schooling up to Grade 10, though still high drop-out throughout the system, therefore the need for second-chance Senior Certificate and vocational training.
 - Annually many more young people passing Matric, thus many in learnerships and NCV (NQF levels 4) programmes already in possession of a Matric, points to need for more post-secondary programmes.
 - Changes in the labour market:
 - The highest rate of unemployment is amongst those without a Senior Certificate or a Matric without a university exemption.
 - Employment chances improve exponentially with increased post-secondary education qualifications (Zuze and Leibrandt, 2009)
 - Labour market shifts at middle and upper ends increasingly requiring more education, communications and technological capabilities.
 - Few young people ages 18-24 years find employment, thus school-leavers thrust into inactivity at a time when they do not have the personal resources and capabilities to cope with this, and at a critical stage in their life cycle.
 - Demographic shifts
 - South Africa's youth bulge – with declining fertility, changes in our previous pyramid shape demographic profile - young people as a proportion of the total population growing. Given current mortality rates, including infant mortality and the impact of the HIV pandemic and other burdens of disease on life expectancy, this bulge will persist over more than one generation (Makiwane and Chimera-Dan, 2009).

- A continued focus on education for all adults – including lost generations of yesteryear:
 - Adults, including grandparents now responsible for raising AIDS orphans and grandchildren, workers who have decades of experience, but were excluded from gaining a formal education and qualifications, many who were laid off as the economy became more capital intensive and employed less low level skills during the 1990s.
 - Many of the so-called lost generation of youth from the 1980s and early 1990s are now in their mid to late 30's and 40s. They too are in need of second chance opportunities, having lost out due to the political situation during their school years and continued to be marginalised from the education and training system.
- A historic legacy of under-investment in adult and youth education, with the emphasis of the last eighteen years on schooling and to some extent universities. It is only over the last five years that we have seen larger investment in the FET colleges system.

Vision for adult and youth education

3. Given the wide range of community and other educational experiences that have evolved and continue to develop in South Africa our vision for youth and adult education should be within a democratic learning framework. Within this framework, career and human capital learning and learning for citizenship could serve the vision of a democratic and more equitable society, drawing on the theoretical concepts of Freire, Dewey and others. In this framework, education should empower people (individuals and communities) to define their identity, take control of their lives, raise healthy families, take part confidently in developing a just society, and play an effective role at work, in the development of their communities and governance.
4. South Africa should therefore seek to build and expand the education and training system to provide more opportunities for adults and young people, in the context of:
 - A sound basic education system that provide foundational competencies and skills; and
 - Expanding lifelong and second chance learning opportunities for young people and adults.

The target groups

5. It is suggested that the target of lifelong learning opportunities should be all citizens, but with a bias to young people, as the labour force of tomorrow (Lolwana, 2011). If this is the bias, we must be upfront about the type of inter-generational sacrifices this will require.
6. For the purposes of identifying the specific niche of the institutional model, the youth and adult target groups are disaggregated as follow, focussing on their education levels, and both formal and non-formal lifelong learning opportunities needed:

Age group	Educational levels	Formal learning opportunities	Non-formal and popular education needs
Below 15 years	Those who dropped out of school before completing primary and high school, require different interventions from	Literacy, GETC, remedial high school and vocational programmes. Expand DoE Technical schools	Life skills and other at-risk youth interventions. Democracy, self-empowerment, social (health, etc) and entrepreneurial education. ICT

Age group	Educational levels	Formal learning opportunities	Non-formal and popular education needs
	adults and older youth.	for this group.	education and exposure.
16-18 years	Not in school with • Primary or less • Secondary but < Grade 10 • Grade 10 but < Grade 12	Literacy, GETC and the full-time NCV	Life skills, democracy, self-empowerment, democracy, social and entrepreneurial education. Employability skills ⁵ and labour market preparation and information. ICT education and exposure
18-24 years	Out of school with • Primary or less • Secondary but < Grade 10 • Grade 10 but < Grade 12	GETC, appropriate Matric, including NC(V), NASCA and vocational programmes, , National Youth Service and NYDA entrepreneurial programmes	Life skills, democracy, self-empowerment, democracy, social and entrepreneurial education. Employability skills and labour market preparation and information. ICT education and exposure
	Weak Matric passes	Vocational programmes College and university bridging programmes Worked base or occupational programmes, including N courses, bridging programmes leading into apprenticeships and learnerships. NYDA National Youth Service and entrepreneurial programmes.	Life skills, democracy, self-empowerment, social and entrepreneurial education. Employability skills and labour market preparation and information. Technology education.
Adults 25-65	Less than Grade 9 • functionally illiterate • < Grade 7 • < Grade 9	Adult literacy, Vocational programmes. Worked base or occupational programmes	Democracy and community development, social and entrepreneurial education. Labour market information
	Grade 10 and more	NASCA, vocational programmes and worked base or occupational programmes. college and university bridging programmes	Democracy, and community development, social and entrepreneurial education. Labour market information

A distinct and unique adult and youth education model?

- The needs of the above target groups are diverse, whether disaggregated by age or learning requirements. The Task Team therefore sees these needs being met through a network of post-school programmes and institutions that are diverse, yet linked.
- Such a network of programmes should be based on an integrated core curriculum that emphasises the core competencies that will enable youth and adults to function in changing communities, a changing world and labour markets, combining formal learning opportunities, vocational and occupational electives, and non-formal and popular education programmes.

⁵ See for example Marock (2008).

9. The substance of the model is as follows:

Two tier/part Institutional model: Community learning centres and an Expanded and differentiated Colleges sector that includes Community colleges, and changes the focus of current FET colleges

Part 1: Community Learning Centres targeting adults and youth in need of literacy, ABET and with less than Grade 10

- (a) A ***Kha Ri Gude learning network*** that develops and implements public education programmes, focussing initially on open access literacy and ABET programme through a network of learning circles. The current ABET curriculum should be restructured with a core curriculum that is theme based, linked with vocational and citizen and popular education programmes, both formal and non-formal. This network should be expanded over time to provide other public education programmes for example basic health, community and social education, voter education, and other soft skills, in partnership with community groups and other state departments and spheres of government.
- (b) ***Community Learning Centres (CLCs)*** as new public and private institutions, incorporating the PALCs and providing support to the delivery of Kha Ri Gude learning network programmes, running restructured ABET programmes, and offering GETC, NASCA as well as soft vocational skills (i.e. skills programmes that are generally non-technical that does not require physical infrastructure beyond classrooms, such as workshops – the humanities or social sectors in vocational education and skills development?)

Some of the CLCs, given infrastructure and local demand should be expanded to operate as Community Learning and Training Centres, offering hard skilled vocational training courses that require training facilities and equipment, including NATED courses, in addition to the other education programmes. These CLCs should link directly with the EPWP, the infrastructure development and LED programmes, and relevant SETAs, especially in manufacturing sectors.

The CLCs should be delinked from schools, although they should continue to use school facilities. The initial set of CLCs should include some of the FET satellite campuses, stronger PALCs and Community Learning Centres with own facilities, and making use of disused schools, colleges and government and community buildings, including Thusong centres. The CLCs should establish satellite campuses, so that eventually all potential users are not more than 10km away from such a centre.

CLCs should be linked with their local Colleges for articulation between their programmes and that of the Colleges. The CLCs should link closely with communities, popular education networks, business and local government, to ensure dynamic local development and local labour market linkages.

- (c) The creation of an *Adult and Youth Community Learning Agency*, that will be responsible for coordination of the Kha Ri Gude network programmes and the development of CLCs, including governance, curriculum and materials development, career and labour market information (working with the DoL and NYDA), popular education programmes, lecturer and management development and support and research.

Part 2: A differentiated and expanded colleges sector

10. The Task Team agrees with the Green paper concept of a differentiated Colleges system that will cater for youth and adults who want to complete the NASCA, who have weak Matric certificates and who want to access vocational, artisan, learnership and HE bridging programmes. It should link to the CLCs in their area, with funding provided for articulation between CLCs and the Colleges sector. Therefore proposes the following differentiation:

- (d) ***Community colleges***, to eventually have one in every municipality. Should provide formal and non-formal learning programmes, including NATED and NASCA, soft vocational and occupational skills programmes, para-professional training in the social sector (e.g. ECD, home-based care, primary health care workers, etc), support programmes for SMMEs, cooperatives. Non-formal and popular learning programmes based on needs of local community, but also specific youth employability, life skills and ICT education, in co-operation with NGOs, FBOs, NYDA and social movements. The Community colleges should eventually deliver two year post-secondary qualifications and higher education bridging programmes, which will require strong linkages with their local universities from the onset. Some should also eventually evolve to provide HE qualifications such as HE diplomas and certificates.

Some of the current FET colleges and or satellite campuses may fit this bill, but we should aim to identify some of the 21 newly envisaged FET colleges to be piloted as Community colleges, from scratch. Over the next decade, all municipalities should be required to set aside land for community colleges.

- (e) Transforming the current FET colleges into specialising ***Vocational Education and Training Colleges and Colleges of Technology***. These colleges should provide the NCV and NATED courses, with an expanded menu of vocational courses, NQF levels 4-5 offerings, artisan programmes and with strong articulation and links from the onset with University of Technologies, becoming a natural feeder system for UTs. These colleges too should be required to provide non-formal programmes listed above for community colleges, but appropriate to their programme offerings and the local communities and labour market.
- (f) Specialised ***single purpose public or private colleges***, e.g. nursing, agricultural, hospitality, performing arts, etc linked towards the various departments, university faculties and professional or sectoral structures.
- (g) The ***SA Institute for Vocational and Continuing education*** and training envisaged in the Green Paper should provide coordination and support to this differentiated college

system.

Table : Proposed Institutional model

NQF LEVEL	Institution	Mission	Programme offerings (formal and non-formal)
L 4-5	Community colleges	Second and first chance Matric, linked to vocational skills and non-formal education for youth and adults. Vocational and occupational opportunities	NASCA, NCV, soft vocational skills, Para-professionals, social learnership, non-formal and popular education, university bridging courses.
	Vocational education and training colleges and Colleges of Technology	Development of middle level vocational and artisan skills Bridging programmes to University of Technology degrees	Vocational artisan, NATED and expanded NQF 4-5 offerings, UT bridging programmes and foundation diplomas
	Single purpose colleges	Responding to particular developmental, sectoral (e.g. nursing or agriculture, or hospitality) or local need.	Certificate and diplomas in area of specialisation
	SA Institute for Vocational and Continuing education	Development of the differentiated colleges sector.	
L 1-3	Community Learning Centres	Adult basic education and GETC linked to vocational skills, may lead to NASCA or NCV. Institutional support to Kha Ri Gude network programmes at local levels.	ABET, soft vocational skills, GETC, NASCA, some CLCs focus on hard vocational skills and NCV, community and non-formal education, Kha Ri Gude learning network programmes.
	Kha Ri Gude learning network	Literacy and public education	Literacy, public and community education.
	Adult and Youth Community Learning and Popular education Institute	Development of literacy, community learning, popular and public education.	

11. All the above institutional forms should have a component of *Open and Distance learning*, including e-learning programmes.

Two Options

12. Based on the above institutional framework, the Task Team therefore recommends two options:
13. **Option 1:** Community Learning Centres as distinct and separate institutions focussing on literacy, ABET, GETC and Senior Certificate programmes with a vocational element; *plus* a differentiated Colleges system that includes Community colleges, a shift in focus of appropriate FET colleges towards strong vocational and technology colleges and single-purpose colleges (e.g. agricultural, ICT, nursing, teaching, or performing arts). This implies a three tier or three sectors/sub-systems of Post-school institutional models: (I) Community Learning Centres, (ii) a College sector; and (iii) a Higher education institutions/University sector.
14. **Option 2:** A two tier system consisting of Colleges and Higher Education Institutions. In this option, the same differentiated Colleges sector as in Option 1, but Community Colleges are also responsible for implementing, supporting and developing Community Learning Centres, with ring-fenced programme funding for literacy and ABET. The advantage of this option is that we are not building two distinct new institutional types at the same time, with the resultant capacity and resourcing constraint. It should also allow for greater differentiation and responsiveness in delivery modes.

Governance issues

15. The following preliminary proposals on governance:
 - The two Institutes the AYCLPE and the SAIVCE should be responsible for overseeing the governance of the CLCs and the Colleges sector respectively.
 - The CLCs from the onset must established linkages around articulation, facility and other sharing with the Colleges sector in their area.
 - CLCs must have Governing bodies, with strong community, local government, educational and local business representation.
 - Strong links between CLCs and University Adult Education centres, to help with the development of the sector, research and monitoring and training of adult and popular education educators.

Institutional development and capacity building

16. The differentiated sector needs to be phased in, but not only in a sequential manner, but in parallel, to enable the development of the sector as a whole and in tandem.
17. We must ensure that current capacities are preserved and enhanced, at University adult education centres, in the public and private FET sector, as well as within the not-for-profit and popular education sectors. An investigation into the personnel requirements for the sector must be conducted as part of the Feasibility study envisaged by the Task Team.
18. The final Report will include a section on infrastructure, including existing under-utilised public infrastructure.

Legal and policy framework

19. Although youth and adult education should be part of a Post-school system that facilitates lifelong learning, international examples show that there are certain peculiarities that may either require a separate policy or White paper and Act, or a substantial Chapter in an overarching Post school Green and White paper.
20. The differentiated proposals made here will also require cautious attention to the legal framework, that should go beyond the current process of bureaucratic amendments to the FET Colleges Act.
21. The Final proposal will also clarify or present options on the different responsibilities of national, provincial and local spheres of government.

Linkages and articulation

22. The CLCs should from the onset established strong articulation linkages with the relevant colleges, and public funding should be provided for articulation programmes.
23. Similarly, the Colleges should forge close links with relevant university faculties or university of technology around articulation programmes.
24. The entire system should seek to integrate the non-formal, popular and formal education sectors, without interfering with the autonomy of organisations and groups that currently run popular education programmes. The formal sector should draw on the strengths of the non-formal sector (particularly their community responsiveness and focus on citizen and social education), and we should aim to strengthen and expand popular citizen and community education.
25. The public CLCs and Colleges should (compete) to provide programmes funded by the SETAs, as well as by different departments and spheres of government.
26. The current process and review of the NQF and the Qualification authorities are relevant, to provide for a more flexible system of lifelong learning, and greater articulation. It may be considered that three different Quality Authorities may simply continue to reinforce the silo mentality with regards articulation. The Final report will refer to international lessons in this regard.
27. The local community and local labour market linkages will also be critical to develop, including links with the schooling sector for career guidance and promotion of this sector amongst learners, but also strengthening schools through reading, after care programmes and so forth.
28. The Final report will make recommendations on Recognition of Prior Learning.

Funding

29. The ambitious targets in both the National Development Plan and the Green paper will

require additional public funding to what is already budgeted for the sector. This should be phased in over the two decades and there should a direct link between the rate of growth of the system and the budget allocation, otherwise we are again setting a system that is inherently poor quality.

30. NSAFS funding for students should cover all the different institutional forms.
31. The public institutions should also actively compete to provide SETA and other skills programmes, so that they augment their funding.

Section 4:

Implementation steps

By end April 2012 (End of Task team mandate)

1. Some preliminary consensus around the model and options.
2. The Task Team Final Report Expand will include more detailed proposals around governance, funding, capacity building, infrastructure, etc.

Beyond April (3-4 months?)

3. Incorporated consensus proposals into Green and White paper process
4. Conducting detailed Institutional model Feasibility study
5. Develop Implementation plan and costing, and projections over two decades.

REFERENCES

(work in progress)

African National Congress (1994). *The Reconstruction and Development Programme*. Umanyano Publishers: Braamfontein.

Aitchison, John. (2012). "Review of international literature on appropriate institutional forms for lifelong learning." Commissioned by the Community Education and Training Task Team, Department of Higher Education.

Aitchison, John. (2012b). "Grale II. Background paper on multi-purpose community learning spaces and centres."

Altman, Miriam and Marock, Carmel. (2008). "Identifying appropriate interventions to support the transition from schooling to the workplace." HSRC. November 2008.

Altman, Miriam and Potgieter-Gqubule, Febe. (2010).

Bird, Adrienne and Elliot, Gail. (1993).

Cloete, Bailey, Bunting and Maassen. (2011). *Universities and economic development in Africa*. CHET: Wynberg, Cape Town.

Cloete, Nico. (2011). "Responding to the NEET crisis." Presentation to the NEET seminar organised by CHET and FETI, Irene Lodge, Pretoria. 28 July 2011.

Cosser, Michael. (2011). "Pathways through the education and training system: do we need a new model?" *Perspectives in Education*, vol. 29 (2), pp. 70-79.

Department of Education (2008). *Report of the Ministerial Committee on Adult Education*. DOE: Pretoria/Tshwane.

Department of Higher Education and Training. (2009). *After school, what? Opening wider and more flexible learning pathways for youth*. Report of the Ministerial Committee on Post-compulsory and post-schooling provision in South Africa. Final report, March 2009.

Department of Higher Education and Training. (2011). "Call for comments on the proposed Qualifications sub-frameworks for General and Further Education and Training, Higher Education, and Trades and Occupations." Notice 913 of 2011, Government Gazette, vol. 558 (34883), 23 December 2011 .

Department of Higher Education and Training. (2012). *Green Paper for Post-School Education and Training*. DHET: Pretoria.

Learn and Teach/ELP/LACOM. (1991). *Never too old to learn! Towards formulating policy for adult basic education in a post-apartheid South Africa*. Learn and Teach Publications: Johannesburg.

Lolwana, Peliwe. (2011). "Education is a public and social good for everyone." Presentation to the CETC Task Team on 5 December 2011.

National Treasury. (2011). "Confronting youth unemployment: policy options for South Africa." Discussion paper for public comment. February 2011.

Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. (2005). *Education at a glance. OECD Indicators*. OECD:Paris.

Phillip, Kate. (2001). "MDA - a case study of job creation through rural enterprise support." Paper presented at Wits University, March 2001

Raphotle, Mabu. (2012). "Literature review on the institutional forms in South Africa that caters for the education and training needs of out-of-school unemployed youths and adults." Commissioned by the Community Education and Training Task Team, Department of Higher Education.

Sheppard, Charles. (2009). "The education status of youth." HSRC/UNFPA *Study on the Status of Youth, 2009* for the Department of Social Development.